# CANADIAN GRADUATE JOURNAL OF SOCIOLOGY AND CRIMINOLOGY





www.cgjsc-rcessc.uwaterloo.ca

Volume 1 Issue 1 Summer 2012

# REVUE CANADIENNE DES ÉTUDES SUPÉRIEURES EN SOCIOLOGIE ET CRIMINOLOGIE





www.cgjsc-rcessc.uwaterloo.ca

Volume 1 Numéro 1 Été 2012

# The Canadian Graduate Journal of Sociology and Criminology La revue canadienne des etudes supérieures en sociologie et criminologie

**Editors / Éditeurs:** 

David C. Hofmann – University of Waterloo, Canada Carlie L. Leroux-Demir – University of Waterloo, Canada Noorin Manji – University of Waterloo, Canada

Copy Editor / Réviseure: Michelle Ricci – Concordia University, Canada

Editor-in-Chief for Volume 1, Issue 1 / Rédactrice en chef pour volume 1, numéro 1: Carlie L. Leroux-Demir – University of Waterloo, Canada

**Book Review Editor / Rédacteur de recensions: David C. Hofmann** – *University of Waterloo, Canada* 

Advisory Board / Conseil consultatif: Martin Bouchard, Ph.D. – Simon Fraser University, Canada Carolyn Brooks, Ph.D. – University of Saskatchewan, Canada Jason Carmichael, Ph.D. – McGill University, Canada Peter Carrington, Ph.D. – University of Waterloo, Canada Christopher J. Fries, Ph.D. – University of Manitoba, Canada Sylvia Fuller, Ph.D. – University of British Columbia, Canada Kevin D. Haggerty, Ph.D. – University of Alberta, Canada Kelly Hannah-Moffat, Ph.D. – University of Toronto, Canada Marc Lafrance, Ph.D. – Concordia University, Canada Barbara Mitchell, Ph.D. – Simon Fraser University, Canada Carlo Morselli, Ph.D. – Université de Montréal, Canada Marc Ouimet, Ph.D. – Université de Montréal, Canada Jennifer L. Schulenberg, Ph.D. – University of Waterloo, Canada

#### Focus and Scope:

CGJSC is a peer-reviewed graduate journal seeking original content and discussion by graduate students researching within the disciplines of sociology and criminology. The scope of CGJSC is purposefully broad in order to offer a diverse range of graduate students the opportunity to submit their research for publication. Examples of acceptable submissions that fall within the journal's scope are, but not limited to: **theory pieces, conceptual pieces, critical analyses, substantive explorations and book reviews.** Qualitative, quantitative and mixed methodologies are accepted. We aim to publish insightful and well-written empirical pieces that enrich the collective knowledge within the disciplines of sociology and criminology.

CGJSC welcomes submissions from graduate students involved in research outside of, but related to, the disciplines of sociology and criminology. All fields within the social sciences (ex: Political Science, History, Psychology, Religious Studies, Women's Studies, Labor Studies, Health Sciences, Economics, Anthropology) are encouraged to submit provided that they demonstrate a direct link to a sociological and/or criminological area of study.

#### **Peer Review Process:**

Submissions selected for blind peer-review are distributed to at least two (2) graduate student or faculty reviewers within the same field of expertise. CGJSC uses a blind peer-review process where the identities of the submitting author as well as those of the peer-reviewers are unknown to each party. All efforts will be made by the managing editor(s) to keep the identities of the submitting author and peer-reviewers confidential.

#### **Publication Frequency:**

CGJSC publishes semi-annually: once in the summer and again in early winter in conjunction with uWaterloo's annual <u>Emerging Realities Graduate Student Conference</u>.

#### **Open Access Policy:**

This journal provides immediate open access to its content on the principle that making research freely available to the public supports a greater global exchange of knowledge.

#### Centre d'intérêt :

La RCESSC est une revue scientifique évaluée par les pairs sollicitant des textes originaux et des discussions auprès des étudiants diplômés faisant des recherches dans les disciplines de la sociologie et de la criminologie. Le domaine couvert par la RCESSC est délibérément large afin d'offrir à une gamme diversifiée d'étudiants diplômés l'occasion de soumettre leurs recherches pour publication. Les exemples de soumissions acceptables relevant du domaine couvert par la revue comprennent, sans s'y limiter, les textes théoriques, les textes conceptuels, les analyses critiques, les explorations de fond et les comptes-rendus de livres. Des méthodologies qualitatives, quantitatives et mixtes sont acceptées. Nous cherchons à publier des textes empiriques pénétrants et bien écrits qui sauront enrichir le savoir collectif à l'intérieur des disciplines de la sociologie et de la criminologie.

La RCESSC sollicite des articles des étudiant(e)s des cycles supérieurs qui participent à des recherches dans diverses disciplines qui peuvent être reliées à la sociologie et à la criminologie. Tous les étudiant(e)s des cycles supérieurs appartenant à domaines pertinents aux sciences sociales, comme les sciences politiques, l'histoire, la psychologie, les études religieuses, les études des femmes, les études du travail, les sciences de la santé, l'économie, l'anthropologie, sont encouragés à proposer des articles qui établissent un lien direct à la sociologie et à la criminologie.

#### Processus d'évaluation par les pairs:

Les soumissions sélectionnées pour un examen aveugle par les pairs seront distribuées à au moins deux réviseurs étudiant(e)s des cycles supérieurs dans le même champ d'expertise. La RCESSC utilise un processus aveugle de révision par des pairs où les identités de l'auteur(e) et des réviseurs sont inconnu(e)s de chaque partie. Tous les efforts seront faits par le(s) éditeur(s) en chef pour conserver les identités de l'auteur(e) et des pairs confidentielles.

#### Périodicité

La RCESSC publie semestriellement : une fois durant l'été et à nouveau au début de l'hiver en conjonction avec la Conférence des étudiant(e)s des cycles supérieurs sur les réalités émergentes de l'U de Waterloo (<u>Emerging</u> <u>Realities Graduate Conference</u>).

#### Politique d'accès libre:

Cette revue fournit un libre accès immédiat à son contenu selon le principe que de rendre la recherche gratuitement accessible au public supporte un plus grand échange mondial de connaissance.

#### Editorial Correspondence / Contact de la Revue:

E-mail/ Courriel: cgjsc@uwaterloo.ca Website / Site Web: <u>http://cgjsc-rcessc.uwaterloo.ca</u> 200 University Ave East PAS Building, Office 2045 Waterloo, ON N2L 3G1

ISSN (online / en ligne): 1927-9825

Logo and Cover Design by: Design is Yummy (<u>http:///www.designisyummy.com</u>)

# CGJSC / RCESSC

# VOLUME 1 - ISSUE / NUMÉRO 1 - SUMMER / ÉTÉ 2012

# **CONTENTS / TABLE DES MATIÈRES**

<b>INTRODUCTION</b> From the Editors / Note des éditeurs David C. Hofmann, Carlie L. Leroux-Demir, Noorin Manji	1
Introduction Peter Carrington	4
ARTICLES The Prevalence of Alcohol-Impaired Driving in Edmonton, Alberta: 1991 – 2009 Abu Sadat Nurullah	6
From Frayed Rope to Tight Strings: Negotiating Non-Profit Governance in a Neoliberal State <i>Casey Ready</i>	e 27
An Arranged Marriage: Police – Media Conflict & Collaboration <i>Robert Chrismas</i>	43
<b>BOOK REVIEWS</b> On the Frontlines: Gender, War, and the Post-Conflict Process <i>Nicole Ephgrave</i>	56
Mobility, Sexuality and Aids Susan Langmagne	57
Undesirables: White Canada and the Komagata Maru Story Harini Sivalingam	58
Principles and Practice of Structural Equation Modeling Nassim Tabri, Corinna Marie Elliott	59
NEWS / NOUVELLES Call for Papers (Winter 2013)	60
Appel à communications (hiver 2013)	61



# From The Editors: The Canadian Graduate Journal of Sociology and Criminology's Inaugural Issue

David C. Hofmann, Carlie L. Leroux-Demir, and Noorin Manji University of Waterloo, Department of Sociology and Legal Studies

The Canadian Graduate Journal of Sociology and Criminology (CGJSC) came to be from an impromptu idea during a professional development seminar for Sociology PhD students at the University of Waterloo. While discussing the perils of graduate publishing, we realized that the opportunities for graduate students to learn the culture of academic publication were few and far between. Many of us felt confused, afraid and that we did not have proper knowledge of the publication process to confidently submit material to existing journals. A discussion ensued about how graduate conferences are legitimate stepping-stones into the life of a professional academic; yet, there was nothing comparable for our written work. While other graduate journals and publication platforms exist, it became rapidly evident to us that the levels of academic rigour akin to the actual publication process were lacking.

We set out to create a journal in which graduate students can share and publish their research in a manner reflecting the realities of professional academic publication, while espousing an understanding and didactic approach. We strive to be the best journal that we can be, mirroring the academic standards of other peer-reviewed publications, while concurrently understanding that the graduate experience is about learning and growing. Through our use of an open-access journal format, social networking platforms, and other communication technologies, our hope is to be accessible and pivotal in uniting graduate scholarship across Canada.

At its heart, CGJSC is a journal *for* graduate students, *by* graduate students across Canada and beyond. To foster inclusiveness, we chose to make our journal bilingual to reflect the multicultural and multilingual nature of Canada. Though centered on the disciplines of sociology and criminology, in keeping with our philosophy of inclusivity, we actively encourage contributions and involvement from Masters and Doctoral students across all the social sciences. Becoming involved with CGJSC is not just limited to publishing, but includes editorial tasks such as peer-reviewing, copy-editing, manuscript selection, among other roles.

CGJSC could not have been established without the dedication of numerous individuals. First and foremost, we would like to thank the University of Waterloo department of Sociology and Legal Studies for both material support and guidance, in particular the encouragement of Dr. Lorne Dawson. The efforts of Dr. Peter Carrington and Dr. Jennifer Schulenberg were also critical during our formative stages. Their editorial expertise was an invaluable asset in learning how a high-quality journal should operate. The University of Waterloo Library Services provided CGJSC with much needed technical support. The efforts of Tim Ireland, Chris Gray, Graham Faulkner and Pascal Calarco were fundamental in laying the foundation of establishing our journal's infrastructure. Additional thanks go out to our faculty advisory board who continue to champion our cause in many departments across Canada. Lastly, we would like to acknowledge the integral contribution of our anonymous peer-reviewers. Peer-reviewers are the cornerstone of the publication process, and without their hard work, this issue would not have been possible.

We hope you enjoy reading our first issue, and all the issues to come. The task of publishing a graduate journal has been a challenging but rewarding experience for us – we hope the fruits of our (and your) labour will be enjoyed by our readership for many years to come!



# Note des éditeurs : publication du premier numéro de la Revue canadienne des études supérieures en sociologie et criminologie

David C. Hofmann, Carlie L. Leroux-Demir, and Noorin Manji University of Waterloo, Department of Sociology and Legal Studies

La Revue canadienne des études supérieures en sociologie et criminologie (RCESSC) est née d'une idée impromptue qui a surgie lors d'un séminaire de perfectionnement professionnel pour les étudiants de doctorat de sociologie à l'Université de Waterloo. Tout en discutant des écueils reliés à la publication des étudiants diplômés, nous avons réalisé que les occasions pour les étudiants des cycles supérieurs de se familiariser avec la culture des éditions universitaires étaient peu nombreuses. Plusieurs d'entre nous, comme étudiant, avaient ressenti une certaine inquiétude face à l'inconnu et au fait que nous ne connaissions pas à fond le processus de publication, pour proposer avec assurance des articles à des revues existantes. Une discussion a suivi sur les conférences de recherche qui représentent des étapes légitimes dans la vie d'un universitaire professionnel. Pourtant, rien ne peut se comparer à notre travail écrit. Tandis que d'autres revues universitaires et d'autres plateformes de publications existent, il est devenu rapidement évident que le niveau de rigueur académique qui accompagne le processus réel de publication était absent.

Nous avons alors décidé de créer une revue où les étudiants des cycles supérieurs peuvent partager et publier leur recherche dans un cadre qui reflète les réalités de la publication universitaire professionnelle, tout en adoptant une compréhension et une approche didactique. Nous nous efforçons de produire une revue de la plus haute qualité, qui est conforme aux normes universitaires des autres publications évaluées par les pairs, tout en admettant que l'expérience universitaire consiste à apprendre et à progresser. Par l'utilisation d'un format de revue dont l'accès est ouvert, des plateformes de réseautage social, et par d'autres technologies de communication, nous espérons que cette revue sera accessible et servira de pivot pour réunir les étudiants de cycles supérieurs du Canada.

Au cœur de cette aventure, la RCESSC est une revue **pour** les étudiants des cycles supérieurs, **par** les étudiants du Canada et d'ailleurs. Pour favoriser l'intégration, nous avons opté pour une édition bilingue de la revue qui reflète la nature multiculturelle et le caractère plurilingue du Canada. Bien que la revue est spécialisée dans les disciplines de la sociologie et de la criminologie, et en accord avec notre philosophie d'intégration, nous encourageons grandement les contributions et la participation des étudiants de la maîtrise et du doctorat de tous les domaines des sciences sociales. Une participation à la RCESSC ne se limite pas uniquement à la publication d'articles, mais inclut, entre autres, des tâches éditoriales comme l'évaluation par les pairs, le travail de révision et le choix des manuscrits.

La RCESSC n'aurait pu voir le jour sans l'engagement de plusieurs individus. En tout premier lieu, nous souhaitons remercier les responsables du département de sociologie et des études juridiques de l'Université de Waterloo, à la fois pour leur soutien logistique et pour leurs conseils, en particulier les encouragements du Dr Lorne Dawson. Les efforts du Dr Peter Carrington et de la Dre Jennifer Schulenberg ont également été essentiels durant les premières étapes de la revue. Leur expertise éditoriale a représenté un atout inestimable pour apprendre les rouages d'une revue de haute qualité. Le service des bibliothèques de l'Université de Waterloo a offert à la RCESSC un soutien technique des plus utiles. Les efforts de Tim Ireland, Chris Gray, Graham Faulkner et Pascal Calarco ont été essentiels pour établir solidement les fondations de l'infrastructure de notre revue. Nous remercions également le conseil consultatif de notre faculté qui ne cesse de défendre notre cause auprès de plusieurs départements universitaires au Canada.

Finalement, nous souhaitons souligner le rôle prépondérant des participants anonymes au processus d'évaluation par les pairs. L'évaluation par les pairs représente la pierre angulaire de la publication universitaire, et sans la qualité de leur travail, ce numéro n'aurait pu voir le jour. Nous espérons que vous prendrez plaisir à lire notre premier numéro, et ceux qui suivront. Le travail relié à la publication d'une revue universitaire a représenté un défi, mais également une expérience enrichissante pour nous tous : nous espérons que les fruits de ce labeur seront appréciés par notre lectorat pour des années à venir.



## Introduction

It is a pleasure and a privilege to write this introduction – as it was a privilege and a pleasure to be invited to serve on the advisory board of this journal at its inception earlier this year. When the three founding co-editors announced their intention to start a Canadian graduate journal of sociology and criminology, I was excited but cautious: excited because I believe that journals are the lifeblood of science, and that an evident need for one was going to be satisfied—and by students in my own department; cautious because I know how much time and energy it takes to edit a journal—not to mention getting it off the ground—and how easy it is to be diverted by it from one's own research. Less than a year later, the Canadian Graduate Journal of Sociology and Criminology is alive and apparently thriving, on the evidence of the three articles selected for publication in this inaugural issue.

The paper by Abu Sadat Nurullah is a classic correlational study of alcohol-impaired driving in Edmonton between 1991 and 2009. Using data from the Alberta Surveys conducted by the Population Research Laboratory of the University of Alberta, the paper analyzes changes over time in the prevalence of alcohol-impaired driving and the use of designated drivers, and in the demographic correlates of alcohol-impaired driving. Time series charts and tables show the trends over time, and logistic regression models estimated separately for 1991 and 2009 show the changes over time in the correlates of impaired driving.

Casey Ready's article on the changing role of non-profit organizations in the neo-liberal state reports data from public documents and from interviews and focus groups conducted during 2010-11 with staff and members of three Ontario YWCAs. Drawing on the political economy theory articulated by Offe, Panitch, and others, and the feminist perspective of Naples, the research shows the changes in self-definition, governance, and service delivery consequent upon the neo-liberal policies and practices of successive Ontario governments, both Conservative and Liberal.

The article by Robert Christmas on police-media relations incorporates perspectives from administrative science, organizational theory, and peacemaking theory to frame a participant-observer case study of police-media relations, by a serving police officer with long experience of dealing with the media. An original contribution of the paper is its emphasis on "collaboration" —working together to resolve the conflicts that inevitably result from different organizational objectives and cultures, in order to achieve mutually beneficial results—and its evidence-based prescriptions for more effective collaborations between different kinds of interdependent organizations.

Readers of this issue may be impressed, as I was, by its wide range—both intellectual and institutional. The authors are affiliated with departments of sociology, peace studies and Canadian studies, at the Universities of Alberta and Manitoba, and at Trent University in Ontario. The articles are written from widely varying theoretical perspectives, using very different kinds of data and of data analysis. On the evidence of this inaugural issue, this journal is becoming truly pan-Canadian. Long may it publish!

Peter Carrington Professor of Sociology and Legal Studies University of Waterloo



# Introduction

C'est un plaisir et un privilège de rédiger la présente introduction – tout comme ça a été un privilège et un plaisir d'avoir été invité à siéger au conseil consultatif de cette revue au moment de sa fondation plus tôt cette année. Lorsque les trois corédacteurs en chef fondateurs ont annoncé leur intention de lancer la *Revue canadienne des études supérieures en sociologie et criminologie*, j'ai ressenti à la fois de l'enthousiasme et de la prudence : de l'enthousiasme parce que j'estime que les revues constituent la pierre angulaire de la science, et que le lancement de cette revue, par des étudiants de mon propre département, comble un besoin évident, et de la prudence parce que je suis conscient que la rédaction d'une revue exige beaucoup de temps et d'efforts, sans mentionner toutes les étapes qui doivent être effectuées pour en assurer le lancement, et que ces tâches peuvent facilement nous détourner de nos propres travaux de recherche. Moins d'un an plus tard, la *Revue canadienne des études supérieures en sociologie et criminologie* est devenue réalité et semble en très bonne santé, comme l'attestent les trois articles qui ont été choisis aux fins de publication dans ce premier numéro.

L'article d'Abu Sadat Nurullah est une étude corrélationnelle classique de la conduite avec facultés affaiblies à Edmonton entre 1991 et 2009. Au moyen de données tirées de sondages réalisés en Alberta par le Population Research Laboratory de l'Université de l'Alberta, l'article analyse l'évolution au fil du temps de la prévalence de la conduite avec facultés affaiblies et de l'utilisation de conducteurs désignés ainsi que des corrélats démographiques de la conduite avec facultés affaiblies. Des graphiques et des tableaux chronologiques illustrent les tendances au fil du temps, et des modèles de régression logistiques estimés séparément pour 1991 et 2009 présentent la variation au fil du temps des corrélats de la conduite avec facultés affaiblies.

L'article de Casey Ready sur l'évolution du rôle des organismes sans but lucratif dans l'État néo-libéral présente des données provenant de documents publics ainsi que d'entrevues et de groupes de discussion qui ont été recueillies en 2010-2011 auprès d'employés et de membres de trois YWCA de l'Ontario. En s'appuyant sur la théorie de l'économie politique élaborée par Offe, Panitch et d'autres, et sur la perspective féministe de Naples, l'article démontre les changements qui sont survenus dans l'autodéfinition, la gouvernance et la prestation des services en conséquence des politiques et des pratiques néo-libérales de gouvernements successifs de l'Ontario, aussi bien conservateurs que libéraux.

L'article de Robert Christmas sur les relations entre la police et les médias intègre des perspectives provenant de la science administrative, de la théorie organisationnelle et de la théorie de l'établissement de la paix pour établir une étude de cas participant-observateur portant sur les relations entre la police et les médias du point de vue d'un policier en service qui traite depuis longtemps avec les médias. Cet article apporte une contribution originale en mettant l'accent sur la « collaboration » — soit travailler ensemble pour résoudre les conflits qui découlent inévitablement des différences entre les objectifs organisationnels et les cultures afin d'obtenir des résultats mutuellement avantageux —et en se fondant sur des faits pour démontrer comment différents types d'organismes interdépendants peuvent collaborer plus efficacement.

Les lecteurs du présent numéro seront peut-être impressionnés, comme je l'ai été, par sa grande diversité, tant sur le plan intellectuel que sur le plan institutionnel. Les auteurs sont en effet affiliés aux départements de sociologie, des études de la paix et des études canadiennes des universités de l'Alberta et du Manitoba ainsi que de l'Université Trent, en Ontario. Les articles sont écrits en fonction de perspectives théoriques très variées et reposent sur des types de données et d'analyses très différents. Comme le démontre ce premier numéro, cette revue est en voie de devenir véritablement pancanadienne. Longue vie à cette publication!

> Peter Carrington Professor of Sociology and Legal Studies University of Waterloo



# The Prevalence of Alcohol-Impaired Driving in Edmonton, Alberta: 1991 – 2009

# Abu Sadat Nurullah

University of Alberta, Department of Sociology

This study explores the changes in alcohol-impaired driving among a representative sample of Edmontonians from 1991 to 2009. Based on self-report data from the annual Alberta Surveys of 1991, 1992, 1997, and 2009, this study also traces the shift in the impact of standard demographic factors on alcohol-impaired driving in Edmonton, Alberta. Findings show that self-reported alcohol-impaired driving has decreased substantially over the years (10.6% in 1991, 8.4% in 1992, 7.2% in 1997, and 3.7% in 2009). However, there have been little changes in designated driving. In addition, there have been a shift in age-related impaired driving, i.e., people aged 55-65+ report impaired driving more in 2009 (4.8%) compared to 1991 (2.0%) and 1992 (2.2%); while individuals aged 18-34 and 35-54 report impaired driving less in 2009 (4.8% and 2.6%, respectively) compared to 1991 (12.7% and 13.0%, respectively). Logistic regression analyses indicate that gender is a significant predictor of alcohol-impaired driving in 1991 (OR = 3.29, 95% CI = 1.52–7.16), but not in 2009. However, the interaction between age and gender is not significant. The policy implications of the findings are discussed.

Keywords: Alcohol-impaired driving; designated driving; gender; Alberta

Cette étude porte sur les changements dans la conduite affaiblie par l'alcool chez un échantillon représentatif de résidents d'Edmonton entre 1991 et 2009. Fondée sur des déclarations fournies par les automobilistes à l'occasion d'enquêtes annuelles menées en Alberta en 1991, 1992, 1997 et 2009, l'étude décrit aussi des fluctuations dans la portée de facteurs démographiques standard sur la conduite avec facultés affaiblies par l'alcool à Edmonton (Alberta). Les conclusions démontrent une diminution considérable des déclarations de conduite avec facultés affaiblies par l'alcool sur plusieurs années (10,6% en 1991, 8,4% en 1992, 7,2% en 1997, et 3,7% en 2009). Néanmoins, peu de changements ont été observés dans le recours aux conducteurs désignés. En outre, la fréquence de la conduite avec facultés affaiblies a connu des variations dans les différents groupes d'âge. Par exemple, les personnes âgées de 55 ans et plus ont plus souvent déclaré avoir conduit avec des facultés affaiblies en 2009 (4,8%) qu'en 1991 (2,0%) et en 1992 (2,2%), tandis que les personnes âgées de 18 à 34 ans et de 35 à 54 ans ont déclaré moins souvent avoir conduit avec les facultés affaiblies en 2009 (4,8% et 2,6%, respectivement) qu'en 1991 (12,7% et 13,0%, respectivement). Des analyses de régression logistique indiquent que le sexe a été une importante variable explicative de la conduits avec facultés affaiblies en 1991 (OR = 3,29,95% CI = 1,52-7.16), ce qui n'a pas été le cas en 2009. Malgré cela, l'interaction entre l'âge et le sexe n'est pas significative. L'étude comprend une analyse des répercussions de ses conclusions sur certaines politiques.

Mots-clés: conduite avec facultés affaiblies; conducteur désigné; sexe; Alberta

## Introduction

Although there has been a marginal decline in criminal charges related to alcohol-impaired driving during the past few years, it continues to be a key factor leading to preventable traffic injuries and death in Canada. This is evident in three nationally representative surveys on alcohol consumption among Canadians (National Alcohol and Drug Survey conducted in 1989, Canada's Alcohol and other Drugs

Survey conducted in 1994, and the Canadian Addiction Survey conducted in 2004). The 2004 Canadian Addiction Survey indicates the prevalence of alcohol-related impaired driving in Alberta. According to the survey, 9.1 percent of Albertans (approximately 214,000 Albertans) report that they have driven a vehicle after consuming two or more alcoholic drinks in the previous hour, and twice as many (18.2 percent; approximately 427,000 Albertans) report that they have been a passenger in a vehicle driven by a person who have consumed two or more alcoholic drinks in the previous hour during the past year (Alberta Alcohol and Drug Abuse Commission, 2006).

Compared with other provinces and territories in Canada, in 2006, Alberta had the fifth highest fatality rate at 13.4 per 100,000 population, and the highest injury rate at 769.1 per 100,000 population (Danyluk & Holmes, 2008). In addition, Alberta had the highest rate of fatally-injured drivers with a blood alcohol concentration (BAC) above .08 percent (3.44 per 100,000 licensed drivers, compared to a national rate of 1.84) in Canada (Solomon & Chamberlain, 2010). Moreover, each year about 400 people die and more than 26,000 people are injured in over 122,000 motor vehicle collisions in Alberta due to legally impaired (i.e., BAC over 80 mg%) driving (Danyluk & Holmes, 2008).

Over the last two decades, stricter penalties (e.g., a zero alcohol tolerance policy for novice drivers, blood alcohol concentration [BAC] of 0.08/0.05 percent, increased price of alcohol, etc.) have been enforced. Although the rate of impaired driving offences has declined over the last 25 years (see: Brennan & Dauvergne, 2011), it remains an important contributor to traffic fatalities in Alberta. Therefore, research is needed that addresses the prevalence of impaired driving in this area of Canada. In one study, Nurullah (2010a) finds that four percent of adult Albertans (aged 18 and above) report driving a vehicle while impaired (over the legal BAC limit) within the past 12 months. Similarly, Vanlaar, Marcoux, and Robertson (2009) find that 5.6 percent of Canadians report driving at least once within the past 12 months with blood alcohol concentrations (BAC) over 0.08%. Have there been any changes in self-reported alcohol-impaired driving incidents in Edmonton, Alberta since 1991? Have there been any changes in self-reported incidents of being passengers in a vehicle driven by an impaired driver? The current study aims to explore these questions using a representative sample of Edmontonians.

#### **Existing Literature on Alcohol-impaired Driving**

#### Effects of Alcohol Consumption on Impaired Driving

Alcohol-impaired driving is one of the major social problems in Canada, resulting in severe injuries and deaths that are preventable (Beirness & Davis, 2007; Nurullah 2010b). In 1982, 60 percent of drivers killed in road crashes in Canada tested positive for alcohol (Beirness, Simpson, Mayhew, & Wilson, 1994). In a 1983 survey conducted by Transport Canada, 51.8 percent of respondents report operating a vehicle within two hours of consuming alcohol within the past 30 days (Wilson, 1984). A subsequent study in 1988 finds 24.6 percent of drinkers report driving within an hour of consuming two or more alcoholic drinks within the past 12 months (Simpson, Mayhew, & Beirness, 1992). A 1994 study reports 20.5 percent of respondents have operated vehicles after drinking within the past 12 months (McNeil & Webster, 1997). The 2004 Canadian Addiction Survey finds 11.6 percent of licensed drivers have operated a vehicle within an hour of having consumed two or more alcoholic drinks (Beirness & Davis, 2007).

In a time-series analysis for the period of 1972 to 1990 in Ontario, Adrian, Ferguson, and Her (2001) find a strong positive correlation between alcohol consumption and both alcohol involved traffic offenses (r = .89, p < .01) and alcohol involved traffic accidents (r = .82, p < .01). Two factors that have contributed strongly to motor vehicle injuries and fatalities in Alberta and Canada are alcohol-impaired driving and failure to use seat belts (Desapriya, Pike, & Babul, 2006). According to a Transport Canada (2008) report, during the years 2003-2005, 83 percent of fatally injured drinking drivers had been legally impaired, i.e., had a BAC over 80 mg%. Studies consistently provide ample evidence indicating alcohol use as a contributing causal factor for injury (Rehm et al., 2003). This claim is supported by studies that

compare injured cases to non-injured controls (e.g., Borges, Cherpitel, Orozco, Bond, Ye, & Macdonald, 2006), and experimental studies (e.g., Eckardt et al., 1998).

#### Passengers of Drinking Drivers

Dellinger, Bolen, and Sacks (1999) use passenger estimates of drinking and driving to suggest that this behavior may be under-reported by drivers, who may have different perceptions of what constitutes impairment while driving. They find that individuals who report drinking and driving are also more likely to report riding with a drinking driver (44 percent versus 4 percent for persons who do not report drinking and driving). In a study of the blood alcohol concentration (BAC) of passengers, Foss and Bierness (1996) find that among legally impaired drivers with a passenger, 53 percent of passengers have a BAC level of 0.08% and above. These two studies suggest that the rate of impaired driving may be underestimated, and that passengers of drinking drivers are half the time impaired themselves. In addition, Leadbeater, Foran, and Grove-White (2008) find that riding with a peer who have been drinking is strongly associated with adolescents' alcohol-impaired driving, after accounting for all other variables in the equation ( $\beta = .42$ ).

Studies also find regional differences in riding with a legally impaired driver. For instance, 31.9 percent of Ontario high school students report riding in a vehicle with a driver who has consumed alcohol (Adlaf, Mann, & Paglia, 2003). A study in Atlantic Canada finds that overall, 23.3 percent of youth report riding with a driver who has had too much to drink (Poulin, Boudreau, & Ashbridge, 2006). A British Columbia study finds that 13 percent of all residents report that they have ridden within the last 12 months with a cannabis-intoxicated driver, and this is more common among younger compared to older respondents (Stockwell, Sturge, & Jones, 2006). However, the reasons for these regional differences and the factors that contribute to those differences are unclear.

#### Socio-demographic Factors and Impaired Driving

Existing literature has consistently shown that males are considerably more likely to drive while impaired compared to females. These findings have been confirmed both in the general population (Adebayo, 1991; Beirness & Davis, 2007; Holmila & Raitasalo, 2005; Schwartz, 2008) and in college student sample (Marelich, Berger, & McKenna, 2000; Wechsler, Lee, Nelson, & Lee, 2003). In a sample of 324 urban residents in Edmonton, Adebayo (1991) finds that more males have driven a vehicle while impaired (44 percent) compared to females (23 percent).

Previous studies constantly report that drinking and driving behavior is more prevalent among youth compared to members of older populations (Hingson, Zha, & Weitzman, 2009; Leadbeater, Foran, & Grove-White, 2008; McCartt, Mayhew, Braitman, Ferguson, & Simpson, 2009; Poulin, Boudreau, & Ashbridge, 2006). In addition, research indicates that young people are more likely to ride with an impaired driver in comparison to older people (Dellinger, Bolen, & Sacks, 1999). Adebayo (1991) reports that older respondents are less likely than younger ones to drive a vehicle while impaired. Belton, Jhangri, MacDonald, and Voaklander (2005) find in a sample of rural Alberta drivers that alcohol impairment is more prevalent among the drivers aged between 16 and 24. Peck et al. (2008) suggest that crash averting skills of young drivers are more adversely affected by alcohol due to their driving inexperience, immaturity, and less experience with alcohol.

Studies show the impact of other socio-demographic factors — such as level of education, income, employment status, and marital status — on impaired driving. Belton et al. (2005) find in a sample of rural Alberta drivers that single individuals and those with high-school education or less are more likely to be legally impaired. Caetano and McGrath (2005) find that driving under the influence of alcohol and drugs is higher among those with college degree and above, those with high income, among young, males, non-married, white, and employed (full-time). Hasin, Paykin, Endicott, and Grant (1999) find that impaired driving is more prevalent among males, younger population, those with more years of education, white, unmarried, and among the employed. Adebayo (1991) finds significantly more single

respondents (57 percent) report driving while impaired than married respondents (27 percent). Adebayo (1991) also finds that those who are employed full-time are more likely to drive while impaired, compared to those who are unemployed.

Based on the 2004 Canadian Addiction Survey, Beirness and Davis (2007) report that drinking drivers are less likely to be married, but more likely to have a full-time job and to have significantly higher average annual income. Drixler, Krahn, and Wood (2001) find that rural youth with more disposable income, more educational ambition, more church attendance, and more respect for authority figures are less likely to engage in drinking and driving. In addition, O'malley and Johnston (1999) find that individuals with low commitment to religion are more likely to drive after (heavy) drinking. In summary, existing literature suggests that impaired driving is most prevalent among males, young people, employed, non-religious, and non-married individuals. However, the association between education level, income, and impaired driving is less definitive.

The province of Alberta has one of the highest impaired driving rates in Canada, but it is declining. Over the years, Alberta's impaired driving rate has remained second highest in Canada preceded by Saskatchewan, and followed by Prince Edward Island (see Figure 1). Longitudinal data from Statistics Canada indicate that the rates of impaired driving incidents have decreased from 1,070 per 100,000 population in 1986 to 444 per 100,000 population in 2008 (see Figure 2). Figure 2 also illustrates a general increase in impaired driving rates from 1986 to 1991, peaking at 1,168 per 100,000 population in 1991, followed by sharp decline in the subsequent years, and remaining relatively stable during 1998 onwards. This may be the result of strict rules enforcement by the Alberta Government (e.g., Alberta Administrative License Suspension (AALS) program, zero alcohol tolerance for those who are under Graduated Driver Licensing (GDL) program, fine, impounding vehicles, and jail sentence, etc.). According to Alberta Transportation (2009), in 2008, alcohol-related impaired driving was a contributing factor in 22.5 percent of fatal collisions in Alberta (compared to 5.3 percent of injury collisions). On average, approximately 7,700 people are convicted of impaired driving in Alberta each year (Alberta Transportation, 2009). However, Alberta Transportation (2009) report that traffic fatalities have decreased 10.5 percent from 458 fatalities in 2007 to 410 in 2008, and traffic injuries have also dropped 10.3 percent from 24,530 injuries in 2007 to 22,015 in 2008, which is the lowest number of total casualties since 1995.



Note: \* BAC level more than 0.08% mg. Source: Statistics Canada, Uniform Crime Reporting Survey, CANSIM Table 252 0013



Figure 2: Rates of impaired driving incidents, Alberta, 1986-2008

Source: Statistics Canada, Uniform Crime Reporting Survey, CANSIM Table 252 0013

#### **Research Questions**

The current study explores the changes in impaired driving due to alcohol consumption among Edmontonians between 1991 and 2009. The study aims to answer the following two questions: (a) has the prevalence of drinking and driving changed over time among Edmontonians?, and (b) has there been a shift in the impact of standard demographic predictors (gender, marital status, age, income, education etc.) on alcohol-impaired driving in Edmonton, Alberta since 1991? For instance, in 1991, males were three times more likely than females to report alcohol-impaired driving (Nurullah, 2010b). Given the increase of female participation in workforce (621,700 in 1991 versus 957,500 in 2009) and the number of female licensed drivers in recent years (1.13 million in 2005 versus 1.26 million in 2009), is impaired driving still more prevalent among males in 2009?

The current study contributes significantly to our understanding of alcohol-impaired driving in Alberta in several ways. Although previous studies address demographic factors associated with alcohol-impaired driving, they rarely examine changes in the impact of standard socio-economic and demographic factors (gender, marital status, age, income, education etc.) on alcohol-impaired driving over time. It is important to explore these factors as there has been demographic transition in Alberta since 1991 (see: Nurullah, 2010b), which may have leveled the gap between males and females in alcohol-impaired driving over time in a general population. Previous studies have predominantly employed college student samples, and were primarily cross-sectional in nature, which limit generalizability of the findings to the general population. Furthermore, based on the findings of this study, the effectiveness of current intervention strategies and legislative enforcement to reduce alcohol-impaired driving is examined, which will help policymakers to devise better plans to minimize the problem.

#### Methods

#### Data

11

The data for the present study are obtained from the annual Alberta Surveys conducted in *1991*, *1992*, *1997*, and *2009*, by the Population Research Laboratory (PRL) at the University of Alberta. These are the only years the Alberta Surveys collected data on impaired driving. The data come from random sample cross-sectional surveys of households in the province of Alberta. The respondents are selected based on a Random-Digit Dialing (RDD) approach to ensure that everyone has an equal chance of being contacted. Data are collected using computer assisted telephone interview (CATI) technology. The survey instrument for each year consisted of the following components: (1) a standardized introduction; (2) questions that reflect the specific research interests of the researchers and agencies conducting the study; and (3) demographic questions.

#### Sample and Procedure

It is important to note that due to unavailability of data on alcohol-impaired driving for the whole province of Alberta in 1991, 1992, and 1997, the analyses are limited to the sample in the Edmonton metropolitan area. The sample is comprised of 491 participants from Edmonton for the 1991 Alberta Survey, 456 participants for the 1992 Alberta Survey, and 403 participants for each of the 1997 and 2009 Alberta Surveys. For each survey year, the questionnaire is pre-tested by trained interviewers on a number of households (between 20 and 53), and some of the questions are modified based on the feedback provided by the respondents prior to the main phase of data collection. The mean length of the interview for each year is between 20 and 27 minutes. Details on the data collection procedure and sample composition are discussed elsewhere (Nurullah, 2010b).

The overall response rates are: 71.1% in 1991, 74.1% in 1992, 62.9% in 1997, and 28.1% in 2009. It should be noted that in recent years response rates for general household surveys are declining (Tourangeau, 2004). Changes in the telecommunications environment, including increased use of caller ID, answering machines, and cell phones, and the introduction of "do not call" lists are likely factors contributing to low response rate (Shults, Kresnow, & Lee, 2009). For instance, the overall response rate for the Alberta Surveys were 73.0% in both 1993 and 1994, 64.0% in 1996, 58.0% in 1998, 54% in 1999, 42.5% in 2006, 36.5% in 2007, and 28.5% in 2008. The low response rate in the current survey should be considered in the context of declining response rates for various types of surveys (Tourangeau, 2004). However, it is often not possible to determine whether a non-response bias exists (Keeter, Miller, Kohut, Groves, & Presser, 2000; see also limitations section). Despite the low response rate in 2009, Figure 2 as well as data on injuries and death (see: Nurullah, 2010b, Figure 3) reveals similar declining trends comparable to the self-report data used in this study.

#### Instruments

#### Drinking and driving

Impaired driving is measured on a dichotomous 'yes' and 'no' scale, assessing alcohol use and impaired driving, designated driver for impaired driving, and riding with an impaired driver. In 1991, 1992, and 2009 Alberta Surveys, the respondents are asked: "In the past 12 months, have you driven while impaired? (over the legal BAC limit of 0.08%)," with the response options of 'yes' and 'no'. However, in the1997 Alberta Survey, the respondents are asked: "Over the last year, how often have you driven while impaired?," with the response options of 'never', 'once or twice', and 'more than twice'. The answers are then dichotomized as follows: never = 'no'; once or twice and more than twice = 'yes'. Furthermore, all the 1991, 1992, and 2009 Alberta Surveys (with the exception of the 1997 Alberta Survey) ask the respondents: "In the past 12 months, have you been a passenger in a vehicle where the driver was

impaired?", "In the past 12 months, have you been in a situation where a designated driver took you home?", and "In the past 12 months, have you been a designated driver for a group?" A designated driver is usually defined as: "A person who agrees to abstain from drinking alcohol and drives for one or more persons who have consumed alcohol" (Barr & MacKinnon, 1998: 549).

Self-reported data regarding a socially and legally offensive behavior such as impaired driving is likely to be underreported. One way to prevent the 'social undesirability bias' in reporting is to be indirect and ask passengers about their frequency of riding with an impaired driver (Dellinger, Bolen, & Sacks, 1999). Soderstrom et al. (1996) investigate the BAC of driver/ passenger sets in motor vehicle fatalities admitted to a trauma center and find 44 percent of the drivers and 43 percent of the passengers are BAC positive. Similarly, Isaac et al. (1995), using the Fatal Accident Reporting System, find that most alcohol-involved fatally injured drivers are together with the passengers who have also consumed alcohol (nearly 80% cases). Therefore, the validity of impaired driving reports may be similar for drivers and passengers, signifying that asking passengers about riding with an impaired driver may be an important alternative measure of impaired driving (Dellinger, Bolen, & Sacks, 1999).

#### Demographic information

The Alberta Surveys collect demographic information, including age, gender, education, marital status, employment, annual income, home ownership, and religious status. The specific categories for each of these variables are discussed in the results section.

#### Analysis

The analyses of data are conducted using all the 1991, 1992, 1997, and 2009 data examining the changes in impaired driving in Edmonton, Alberta from 1991 to 2009. Cross-tabulations,  $\chi^2$ -test, and z-tests are used to compare the demographic differences in impaired driving. Block-wise logistic regression analyses (Peng, Lee, & Ingersoll, 2002) are conducted [since the outcome variable represents dichotomous response categories (yes and no)] to evaluate the factors that predict impaired driving. Odds ratios with 95% confidence intervals (95% CI) are used as summary statistics. Nagelkerke R<sup>2</sup> is used to estimate the variance explained by the models. All reported p values are two-sided; and p < .05 is considered significant.

#### Results

#### Sample Characteristics: 1991, 1992, 1997, and 2009

Table 1 outlines the characteristics of the samples of adult Edmontonians surveyed in 1991, 1992, 1997, and 2009. Given the Population Research Laboratory employs a quota sampling method to obtain equal proportions of males and females in the Alberta Survey, the gender distribution in each sample is estimated to be similar for each year (Gazso & Krahn, 2008). For example, females represent 50.1%, 50.2%, 50.1%, and 50.1% of the respondents, respectively, in 1991, 1992, 1997, and 2009.

The 2009 sample is older, on average, than the 1991 and 1997 samples. For instance, 12.8%, 11.0%, and 13.2% of the respondents are 65 years of age and older in 1991, 1992, and 1997, respectively, compared to 21.9% of the respondents in 2009. On the other hand, the proportion of younger respondents (aged between 18 and 24) has decreased over the years, from 17.5% in 1991 to 7.3% in 2009. The older 2009 sample reveals the fact that, like the Canadian population, the Alberta population is gradually aging (Gazso & Krahn, 2008). The 2009 samples include more married or cohabiting couples compared to the 1991, 1992, and 1997 sample. For example, 65.5% of the respondents are either married or cohabiting in 2009, compared to 54.7%, 50.3%, and 48.6% of the respondents in 1991, 1992, and 1997, respectively. On the other hand, the proportion of single respondents has increased from 26.5% in 1991 to 35.1% in 1997, but decreased to 19.0% in 2009.

The 2009 sample is also better educated, with 47.1% of the respondents having university degrees in 2009, compared to 20.6%, 19.8%, and 24.8% of the respondents in 1991, 1992, and 1997, respectively. On the other hand, the representation of respondents with less than high-school education has decreased from 18.4% in 1991 to 2.7% in 2009. While employment status of the respondents remain relatively analogous between 1991 and 2009 (except in 1997), the 2009 sample is somewhat more affluent. For instance, only 5.9%, 4.5%, and 7.3% of the respondents individually earn \$60,000 and above per year in 1991, 1992, and 1997, respectively, compared to 17.7% in 2009. Note that the income data for 1997 and 2009 are adjusted for inflation based on the Bank of Canada inflation calculator. A similar trend is revealed in the annual household income of the respondents. This increase is probably largely due to inflation over the previous 12 years, although it may also represent a small increase in real incomes in Alberta. Table 1 also illustrates the religious and home ownership/renting pattern of the respondents. In 2009, 26.6% of the respondents have no religion, compared to 20.0%, 17.2%, and 21.0% of the respondents, in 1991, 1992, and 1997 respectively. Finally, in recent years, more respondents (or their spouse/ parents) own a house (79.5% in 2009), compared to 1991, 1992, and 1997 (49.1%, 51.1%, and 57.4%, respectively).

#### Changes in Impaired Driving Over Time

Table 2 illustrates the changes in the self-reported alcohol-impaired driving (over the legal BAC limit) over time in Edmonton, Alberta from 1991 to 2009. Between 1991 and 2009, self-reported alcohol-impaired driving in the past 12 months has decreased from 10.6% (95% CI = 7.28–13.78) to 3.7% (95% CI = 1.82–5.58); and the difference is statistically significant (z = 3.483, P < .001). This declining trend is demonstrated further in Figure 3. The self-reported rate of being a passenger in a vehicle with an impaired driver in the past 12 months has also decreased from 10.9% (95% CI = 7.51–14.07) in 1991 (with 1.0% increase in 1992) to 5.2% (95% CI = 2.99–7.41) in 2009; and the difference is statistically significant (z = 2.671, P < .01).

Table 2 also shows that the rate of being taken home by a designated driver in the past 12 months has remained relatively stable over time. For example, 23.8% (95% CI = 19.4-28.42) of the respondents in 1991, 31.4% (95% CI = 26.26-36.32) of the respondents in 1992, and 27.1% (95% CI = 22.70-31.56) of the respondents in 2009 have indicated that they have been in a situation where designated drivers took them home. Similarly, the rate of being a designated driver for a group in the past 12 months has changed only slightly. For instance, 36.9% (95% CI = 31.63-41.83) of the respondents in 1991, 43.6% (95% CI = 38.18-48.94) of the respondents in 1992, and 37.0% (95% CI = 32.19-41.81) of the respondents in 2009, indicated that they have been designated drivers for a group. However, the rate of changes in designated driving over the years is not statistically significant.

#### Socio-demographic Differences in Impaired Driving

The findings presented in Table 3 illustrate the socio-demographic differences across population subgroups in the rate of impaired driving over time in Edmonton, Alberta from 1991 to 2009. In 1991, statistically significant differences are observed only for gender, age, employment, and individual income. Male respondents are considerably more likely (16.4%) than female respondents (4.9%) to admit to alcohol-impaired (over the legal BAC limit) driving (p <.001). Individuals aged 55 years and older are least likely (only 2.0%) to report "driving while impaired" in 1991, compared to those aged between 18 and 34 (12.7%) and between 35 and 54 years of age (13.0%) (p <.01). Currently employed (both full-time and part-time) individuals are more likely (13.3%) than currently unemployed individuals (5.4%) to report "driving while impaired" (p <.01). Furthermore, respondents with the lowest annual individual income (< \$30,000 per year) are about 50% less likely than those with higher incomes (7.7% versus 16.0%) to report "driving while impaired" (p <.05). However, the differences between subgroups of the sample in marital status, education, religious status, and home ownership are not statistically significant.

#### *CGJSC / RCESSC* Vol. 1, Iss/Num. 1, Summer/Été 2012

#### Table 1:

## Sample Characteristics from the Alberta Surveys 1991, 1992, 1997 and 2009 (Edmonton)

Characteristics	1991	1992	1997	2009
	(N = 491)	( <i>N</i> = 456)	(N = 403)	(N = 403)
Gender				
Male	49.9	49.8	49.9	49.9
Female	50.1	50.2	50.1	50.1
Age				
18-24	17.5	15.6	17.5	7.3
25-34	30.8	32.7	20.1	14.8
35-44	22.2	17.5	26.4	16.9
45-54	9.2	14.0	15.0	22.9
55-64	7.5	9.2	7.9	16.1
65+	12.8	11.0	13.2	21.9
Marital Status				
Never married	26.5	30.1	35.1	19.0
Married/ Cohabiting	54.7	50.3	48.6	65.5
Divorced/ Widowed/ Separated	18.8	19.6	16.3	15.5
Education				
Less than high-school	18.4	21.1	15.5	2.7
Completed high-school	18.6	18.2	20.3	20.3
Some post-secondary	42.4	40.9	39.5	29.8
Post-secondary certificate	20.6	19.8	24.8	47.1
Employment				
Employed (full-time & part-time)	66.1	62.9	68.0	62.8
Not currently employed/Retired	33.9	37.1	32.0	37.2
Annual Individual Income				
Up to \$29,999	64.5	63.1	59.0	42.1
\$30,000 to \$59,999	29.6	32.3	33.7	40.2
\$60,000 to \$100,000+	5.9	4.5	7.3	17.7
Annual Household Income				
Up to \$29,999	34.2	33.2	28.8	14.6
\$30,000 to \$59,999	40.6	39.2	37.8	34.7
\$60,000 to \$100,000+	25.2	27.6	33.4	50.6
Religion				
No religion	20.0	17.2	21.0	26.6
Roman Catholic	28.0	25.6	30.4	21.2
Other Christian	46.2	50.3	42.5	40.6
Jews, Muslims, & others	5.8	6.8	6.1	11.6
Home Ownership				
Own (self/ spouse/ parents)	49.1	51.1	57.4	79.5
Rent	50.9	48.9	42.6	20.5

#### Table 2:

Impaired driving rate in Edmonton, Alberta: 1991 to 2009

Characteristics	1991 Y %	1992 Y %	1997 Y %	2009 Y %
Driven while impaired <sup>1 a</sup>	10.6***	8.4*	7.2	3.7
(95% CI)	(7.28–13.78)	(5.39–11.41)	(4.20–10.20)	(1.82–5.58)
Passenger in a vehicle with impaired driver <sup>2 b</sup>	10.9**	11.9**	n.a.	5.2
(95% CI)	(7.51–14.07)	(8.44–15.48)		(2.99–7.41)
A designated driver took the person home <sup>3</sup>	23.8	31.4	n.a.	27.1
(95% CI)	(19.4–28.42)	(26.26–36.32)		(22.70–31.56)
Being a designated driver for a group <sup>4</sup>	36.9	43.6	n.a.	37
(95% CI)	(31.63–41.83)	(38.18–48.94)		(32.19–41.81)

*Note: N* for the years ranged from 400 to 491. CI = Confidence Interval.

Y % = Percentage of individuals saying "yes" to the question.

n.a. = Data unavailable for year.

\* p < .05, \*\* p < .01, \*\*\* p < .001. Statistically significant difference in proportions from 2009. 1. "In the past 12 months, have you driven while impaired?" (In 1997 Alberta Survey, the question was worded as: "Over the last year, how often have you driven while impaired?")

2. "In the past 12 months, have you been a passenger in a vehicle where the driver was impaired?"

3. "In the past 12 months, have you been in a situation where a designated driver took you home?"

4. "In the past 12 months, have you been a designated driver for a group?"

a. Impaired driving rate in 2009 is significantly different from that of 1991 (z = 3.483, P < .001) and 1992 (z = 2.524, P < .05), but not that of 1997 (z = 1.846, P = .065).

b. The rate of being a passenger in a vehicle with impaired driver in 2009 is significantly different from that of 1991 (z = 2.671, P < .01) and 1992 (z = 3.127, P < .01).





Source: Annual Alberta Surveys 1991, 1992, 1997, and 2009: Population Research Laboratory, U of Alberta.

#### Table 3:

## Impaired driving by demographic characteristics: Edmonton, Alberta, 1991 to 2009

Characteristics	1991	1992	1997	2009
	Y %	Y %	Y %	Y %
Total	10.6	8.4	7.2	3.7
Gender	***	***	**	
Male	16.4 # 1	13.3 # 19	11.1 # 32	5.0
Female	4.9	3.5	3.5	2.5
Age <sup>a</sup>	**	*	*	
18-34	12.7 #2	9.2 # 20	9.5 <sup># 33</sup>	4.8
35-54	13.0 # 3	11.1 #21	9.3 <sup># 34</sup>	2.6
55-65+	2.0 # 4	2.2 # 22	0.0	4.8
Marital Status <sup>a</sup>				
Non married	12.2 # 5	10.8 # 23	8.3	4.4
Married	9.4 # 6	6.1	6.2	3.5
Education <sup>a</sup>			*	
High-school or less	11.6 # 7	8.9 # 24	3.5	4.3
Post-secondary	10.1 # 8	8.1 # 25	9.4 # 35	3.6
Employment	**		*	
Employed	13.3 #9	9.5 <sup># 26</sup>	9.2 <sup># 36</sup>	4.0
Not currently employed	5.4	6.0	3.1	3.4
Annual Individual Income	*			
Up to \$29,999	7.7	8.0	5.9	4.9
\$30,000 to \$59,999	16.7 # 10	9.5 # 27	9.5 <sup># 37</sup>	4.8
\$60,000 to \$100,000+	16.0 #11	0.0	8.7 # 38	4.2
Annual Household Income				
Up to \$29,999	8.0 # 12	7.7 # 28	4.8	3.1
\$30,000 to \$59,999	13.5 # 13	10.2 # 29	8.3 <sup># 39</sup>	3.5
\$60,000 to \$100,000+	10.9 <sup># 14</sup>	7.1	7.3	4.9
Religious Status <sup>a</sup>		***		
Religious	10.0 # 15	6.2	6.4	3.2
Not religious	13.4 # 16	19.5 <sup># 30</sup>	11.0	5.9
Home Ownership				
Own	7.9 # 17	6.5	6.2	4.2
Rent	13.3 # 18	10.0 # 31	7.7 # 40	2.5

*Note: N* for the years ranged from 287 to 491.

Y % = Percentage of individuals saying "yes" to the impaired driving question.

a. Re-categorized to meet the sample requirement for cross-tabulation.

Pearson Chi-square test: \* p < .05, \*\* p < .01, \*\*\* p < .001.

#### Table 3: (continued)

# Statistically significant difference in proportions from 2009:

1. $z = 5.224, P < .001$	15. $z = 3.850, P < .001$	29. <i>z</i> = 3.647, <i>P</i> < .001
2. $z = 3.941, P < .001$	16. <i>z</i> = 3.616, <i>P</i> < .001	30. <i>z</i> = 5.793, <i>P</i> < .001
3. $z = 5.493, P < .001$	17. $z = 2.133, P < .05$	31. $z = 4.305, P < .001$
4. $z = 2.162, P < .05$	18. $z = 5.642, P < .001$	32. $z = 3.159, P < .01$
5. $z = 4.004, P < .001$	19. $z = 4.077, P < .001$	33. $z = 2.524, P < .05$
6. $z = 3.374, P < .01$	20. $z = 2.373, P < .05$	34. $z = 3.966, P < .001$
7. $z = 3.825, P < .001$	21. $z = 4.753, P < .001$	35. $z = 3.245, P < .01$
8. <i>z</i> = 3.563, <i>P</i> < .001	22. $z = 2.073, P < .05$	36. $z = 2.895, P < .05$
9. $z = 4.672, P < .001$	23. <i>z</i> = 3.336, <i>P</i> < .01	37. $z = 2.524, P < .05$
10. $z = 5.486, P < .001$	24. $z = 2.545, P < .05$	38. $z = 2.457, P < .05$
11. $z = 5.562, P < .001$	25. <i>z</i> = 2.617, <i>P</i> < .05	39. $z = 2.801, P < .05$
12. $z = 2.998, P < .01$	26. <i>z</i> = 3.046, <i>P</i> < .01	40. $z = 3.260, P < .01$
13. $z = 5.063, P < .001$	27. $z = 2.524, P < .05$	
14. $z = 3.077, P < .01$	28. $z = 2.808, P < .05$	

In 1992, the overall rate of impaired driving in the past year declines slightly to 8.4% from 10.6% in 1991, and the difference is statistically significant (z = 2.524, P < .05). Statistically significant differences exist only for gender, age, and religious status. Male respondents are considerably more likely (13.3%) than female respondents (3.5%) to report "driving while impaired" (p < .001), a trend which is similar to 1991. Respondents aged 55 years and older are least likely (only 2.2%) to report drinking and driving in 1992, compared to those aged between 18 and 34 (9.2%) and between 35 and 54 years of age (11.1%) (p < .05); this trend is also similar to 1991. Those without religion are considerably more likely (19.5%) than those with religion (6.2%) to report "driving while impaired" (p < .001). However, the differences between subgroups of the sample in marital status, education, employment, income, and home ownership are not statistically significant.

By 1997, the overall rate of impaired driving drops slightly to 7.2%. Statistically significant differences exist only for gender, age, education, and employment. Male respondents are more than three times as likely as female respondents (11.1% vs. 3.5%) to report legally impaired driving (p <.01). Respondents between 18 and 54 are more likely to report "driving while impaired" (over 9%) compared to those aged 55 years and older (0.0%) (p <.05). Those with post-secondary education are more likely (9.4%) to report "driving while impaired" compared to those with high-school education or less (3.5%) (p <.05). Furthermore, currently employed (both full-time and part-time) individuals are more likely (9.2%) than currently unemployed/retired individuals (3.1%) to report "driving while impaired" (p <.05). By 2009, none of the differences across population subgroups in responses are statistically significant.

Table 3 also highlights that between 1991 and 2009, the rate of alcohol-impaired driving in Edmonton, Alberta has declined in every population subcategory surveyed, except for age (55 years and above). All but three (i.e., females, not currently employed, and annual individual income of \$30,000 or less) of the differences over time are statistically significant. With regard to the rate of change over time, self-reported alcohol-impaired driving declines the most among males (16.4% in 1991 vs. 5.0% in 2009, z = 5.224, p < .001), the younger (12.7% in 1991 vs. 4.8% in 2009, z = 3.941, p < .001) and mid-aged (age 35 to 54) respondents (13.0% in 1991 vs. 2.6% in 2009, z = 5.493, p < .001). The rate of impaired driving also declines the most among non-married (12.2% in 1991 vs. 4.4% in 2009, z = 4.004, p < .001), employed (13.3% in 1991 vs. 4.0% in 2009, z = 4.672, p < .001), and religious respondents (10.0% in 1991 vs. 3.2% in 2009, z = 3.850, p < .001). In addition, the rate of impaired driving declines the most among those with post-secondary education (10.1% in 1991 vs. 3.6% in 2009, z = 3.563, p < .001), those with higher annual individual income (16.0% in 1991 vs. 4.2% in 2009, z = 5.562, p < .001), and those who live in a rented house (13.3% in 1991 vs. 2.5% in 2009, z = 5.642, p < .001). Furthermore, the

impaired driving rate increases gradually from 2.0% in 1991 to 2.2% in 1992, to 4.8% in 2009 among the older population (age 55 years and above) (p < .05).

## Table 4:

Logistic Regression	Analysis Prodictin	a Impaired driving	• Edmonton	Alborta 1001
	Analysis I I cululi	2 IIIIDaileu uriviile	. เวนเทยแบบเ. /	AIDELIA. 1771

Variables	Model $\chi^2$	b	Wald $\chi^2$	Odds Ratio	95% CI	95% CI	
					Lower	Upper	
Model 1: Main effect	41.26 (12 d	f)***					
Gender (male = 1)		1.19	9.07	3.29**	1.52	7.16	
Age							
18-34		1.27	2.48	3.56	0.73	17.31	
35-54		1.34	2.71	3.83	0.78	18.90	
55-65+ (ref)							
Marital Status (not married = 1)		0.14	0.16	1.15	0.58	2.28	
Education							
Less than high-school		0.08	0.02	1.08	0.30	3.84	
Completed high-school		1.13	4.72	3.10*	1.12	8.61	
Some post-secondary		0.44	0.84	1.55	0.61	3.96	
Post-secondary certificate (ref)							
Employment (employed $= 1$ )		0.11	0.06	1.12	0.46	2.70	
Religious Status (not religious = 1)		0.35	0.80	1.41	0.66	3.01	
Home Ownership $(own = 1)$		-0.95	5.49	0.39*	0.18	0.86	
Annual Individual Income							
Up to \$29,999 (ref)							
\$30,000 to \$59,999		0.81	4.29	2.25*	1.04	4.86	
\$60,000 to \$100,000+		1.03	2.17	2.80	0.71	11.01	
Constant = -4.72***	–2 Log like	lihood = 24	19.44				
$Cox \& Snell R^2 = .09$	Nagelkerke	$R^2 = .19$					
Variables	Model $\chi^2$	b	Wald $\chi^2$	Odds Ratio	95% CI		
	,,		~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~		Lower	Upper	
Model 2: Interaction	43.12 (14 d	f)***					
Gender x Age							
18-34		1.73	1.22	5.66	0.26	122.98	
35-54		0.88	0.31	2.41	0.11	54.96	
55-65+ (ref)							
Constant = -3.87**	–2 Log like	lihood = 24	17.58				
$Cox \& Snell R^2 = .10$	Nagelkerke	$R^2 = .19$					

Note: N = 422. CI = confidence interval.

p < .05, p < .01, p < .01

Table	5:
-------	----

# Logistic Regression Analysis Predicting Impaired driving: Edmonton, Alberta, 2009

Variables	Model $\chi^2$ b	Wald $\chi^2$	Odds Ratio	95% CI		
					Lower	Upper
Model 1: Main effect	11.67 (12 d	f)				
Gender (male $= 1$ )		0.35	0.33	1.42	0.42	4.77
Age						
18-34		-0.42	0.25	0.65	0.13	3.43
35-54		-1.36	2.67	0.26	0.05	1.31
55-65+ (ref)						
Marital Status (not married $= 1$ )		0.33	0.31	1.39	0.44	4.40
Education						
Less than high-school		2.41	3.94	11.17*	0.78	161.06
Completed high-school		1.02	1.45	2.78	0.53	14.69
Some post-secondary		1.62	4.82	5.03*	1.19	21.30
Post-secondary certificate (ref)						
Employment (employed $= 1$ )		0.40	0.29	1.49	0.35	6.34
Religious Status (not religious = 1)		0.87	1.88	2.38	0.69	8.24
Home Ownership ( $own = 1$ )		0.68	0.64	1.98	0.37	10.59
Annual Individual Income						
Up to \$29,999 (ref)						
\$30,000 to \$59,999		0.07	0.01	1.07	0.27	4.28
\$60,000 to \$100,000+		0.82	0.73	2.28	0.35	14.96
Constant = -4.98***	–2 Log like	lihood = 10	08.75			
$Cox \& Snell R^2 = .04$	Nagelkerke	$R^2 = .11$				
Variables	Model $\chi^2$	b	Wald $\chi^2$	Odds Ratio	95% CI	
					Lower	Upper
Model 2: Interaction	11.89 (14 d	f)				
Gender x Age						
18-34		0.60	0.17	1.83	0.10	33.66
35-54		0.53	0.13	1.70	0.10	29.74
55-65+ (ref)						
Constant = -4.73***	–2 Log like	lihood = 10	08.52			
$Cox \& Snell R^2 = .04$	Nagelkerke	$R^2 = .12$				

Note: N = 313. CI = confidence interval.

p < .05, p < .001.

#### Predicting Impaired Driving: 1991 and 2009

In order to assess the net effects of predictors of impaired driving in Edmonton, Alberta in 1991 and 2009, block-wise logistic regression analyses are conducted. Table 4 and 5 display the logistic regression models predicting alcohol-impaired driving in Edmonton, Alberta in 1991 and 2009. As shown in Table 4, the chi-square statistic for model 1 is significant ( $\chi^2 = 41.26$  (12 d.f.), p < .001), indicating that the socio-demographic variables successfully predict impaired driving in 1991. Investigation of the individual coefficients reveals that gender, education, home ownership, and annual individual income are significant predictors of impaired driving in 1991. Male respondents have 3.29 times greater odds (95% CI = 1.52-7.16) of being impaired drivers, compared to females (p < .01). Those with completed high school education have 3.10 times greater odds (95% CI = 1.12-8.61) of being impaired drivers (95% CI = 0.18-0.86), compared to those who live in a rented house (p < .05). Respondents with an annual individual income between \$30,000 and \$59,999 have 2.25 times greater odds of being impaired drivers (95% CI = 1.04-4.86), compared to those with an income of less than \$30,000 (p < .05). The model explains approximately 19% of the variance in impaired driving (Nagelkerke  $R^2 = .19$ ).

Given the well-established findings indicating that male and younger respondents are more likely to drink and drive (Holmila & Raitasalo, 2005; Schwartz, 2008; Wechsler et al., 2003), a two-way interaction term between age and gender is created. Model 2 in Table 4 shows that the interaction between age and gender is not statistically significant. Furthermore, adding the interaction term to the model does not result in a significant change in model fit ( $\chi^2$  change = 1.86 (2, 12 d.f.), *p* = .39), nor does it account for any significant change in the variance explained in impaired driving (Nagelkerke R<sup>2</sup> remains the same at .19).

However, by 2009, only education status remains a significant predictor of impaired driving. Those with less than high school education have 11.17 times greater odds (95% CI = 0.78-161.06), and those with some post-secondary education have 5.03 times greater odds (95% CI = 1.19-21.30) of being impaired drivers, compared to those with post-secondary credentials (p < .05). However, as displayed in Table 5, the chi-square statistic for both model 1 ( $\chi^2 = 11.67$  (12 d.f.), p = .47) and model 2 ( $\chi^2 = 11.89$  (14 d.f.), p = .61) is statistically non-significant. In addition, the interaction between age and gender is not statistically significant.

## Discussion

A major objective of this study is to examine the changes in alcohol-impaired driving in Edmonton, Alberta from 1991 to 2009. Results indicate that self-reported impaired driving has declined over the years (from 10.6% in 1991 to 3.7% in 2009). The rate of riding with an impaired driver has also decreased from 1991 to 2009. However, there has not been any substantial change in the rate of designated driving (both using a designated driver and being a designated driver for a group). These findings are consistent with the existing literature, as Wallace (2009, p. 25, Table 2) reported that from 1998 to 2008 the overall rate of impaired driving offences reported by police in Canada has dropped by 12 percent. Similarly, using multiple indicators of drinking and driving incidents in Canada from 1998 to 2011, Vanlaar et al. (2012) show that self-reported legally impaired driving rates have declined significantly in recent years. Furthermore, as Figures 1 and 2 indicate, and Brennan and Dauvergne (2011, Chart 14) illustrate, the rate of impaired driving offences has declined considerably from 1980s to 2010 in both Canada and Alberta. As such, this self-reported data on impaired driving in Edmonton are comparable to that of Alberta and Canada.

What may have contributed to the declining rate of impaired driving in Edmonton, Alberta? While it may not be possible to unravel the various causal mechanisms that produce a decrease in the rate of impaired driving in the province, I consider the following several factors. First, the increase in enforcement of legal rulings and regulations against impaired driving (e.g., 0.08 g/dL BAC laws, license

suspension, etc.) for fully-licensed drivers may have contributed to the decline. An evaluation of the Alberta Administrative License Suspension (AALS) program indicates a 19 percent reduction in the recidivism rate for alcohol-involved drivers in casualty collisions, and a 12 percent reduction in the number of fatal collisions involving alcohol in three years after the introduction of the program (Howard Research, 2005). Babor et al. (2010, pp. 103-108) outline several strategies that are effective in reducing alcohol-related problems, which include (a) deterrence, penalty, and social pressure to reduce impaired driving, (b) regulating availability, (c) controlling price and alcohol taxes, and (d) regulating alcohol advertising and marketing.

Second, zero alcohol tolerance for youth who are licensed under the Graduated Driver Licensing (GDL) program may have an impact on the declining rate of impaired driving in the province. Since the implementation of GDL in May 2003, the number of casualty collisions by young new drivers has dropped significantly. For instance, the rate for 18 and 19 year old drivers drops from the pre-GDL level of 30.9 (in 2002) to 20.5 (in 2008) casualty collisions per 1000 licensed drivers (Alberta Transportation, 2009; Alberta Transportation, 2003). Evaluations of GDL programs in the US, Canada, New Zealand, and Australia show strong evidence for reduction in crash rates in all jurisdictions and for all crash types (Hartling, Wiebe, Russell, Petruk, Spinola, and Klassen, 2004; Mayhew, Simpson, & Singhal, 2005; Shope, 2007). In addition, based on data from 46 U.S. States and 11 Canadian jurisdictions, Vanlaar et al. (2009) find strong evidence in support of GDL reducing fatalities (e.g., reduction of 19.1% in the relative fatality risk of 16-year-old drivers).

Third, implementation of DWI/DUI checkpoints or sobriety checkpoints to perform random breath testing could have led to the declining rate of impaired driving. Data are lacking, however, on the extent to which there has been an increase in DWI/DUI checkpoints or sobriety checkpoints in Alberta. Studies find that both random breath-testing (RBT) and selective breath-testing (SBT) checkpoints are effective in reducing alcohol-related crashes and associated fatal and nonfatal injuries (Elder, Shults, Sleet, Nichols, Zaza, & Thompson, 2002; Shults et al., 2001). Fourth, alcohol ignition interlock programs for convicted impaired driving offenders may have contributed to the declining rate of impaired driving. Research shows that interlock devices have led to reduced recidivism by 50% to 90% (Alberta Centre for Injury Control & Research, 2009). Based on combined data from multiple studies, Marques (2009) estimate that interlocks account for 65% reductions in impaired driving recidivism. Fifth, other deterrent factors in impaired driving include fines, impounding vehicles, and jail sentences. It remains unclear, however, as the extent to which these deterrent factors have been increasingly implemented in Alberta.

Finally, there may also have been some impact of nationwide campaigns (e.g., 'Mother's Against Drunk Driving' and 'Arrive Alive Drive Sober') on reducing alcohol-impaired driving in Edmonton, Alberta. In their systematic review of the effectiveness of mass media campaigns, Elder et al. (2004) find a median decrease of 10% in injury crashes. There has been an increase in drug-related impaired driving in recent years in Canada, particularly among young adults (Bédard, Dubois, & Weaver, 2007). Although alcohol-impaired driving is declining in Alberta, drug-related impaired driving may be on the rise. However, future research needs to confirm whether drug-related impaired driving is increasing over the years, and whether there is any causal relationship between the decline in alcohol-impaired driving and the increase in drug-impaired driving in Alberta (if any).

The findings of this study indicate that between 1991 and 2009, the rate of impaired driving (over the legal BAC limit) in Edmonton, Alberta decreases in every socio-demographic segment of the population, except for age (55 years and older). Several important observations can be drawn from the findings. First, the rate of impaired driving has substantially declined among males (from 16.5% in 1991 to 5.2% in 2009) compared to females (from 4.7% in 1991 to 2.6% in 2009), although males continue to be more likely than females to drive while impaired. Why is the decrease in impaired driving among females less prevalent? Part of the explanation is that the rate of impaired driving in females was lower to begin with. While the current data or previous studies do not provide a clear answer to this question, research has suggested some intriguing explanations. In a qualitative study conducted among 16 male and 16 females (aged 20-29 years) in New Zealand, Lyons and Willott (2008) find that on the one hand, women's drinking is linked to pleasure and fun, particularly among those who are frequently intoxicated;

and on the other hand, drunk women are positioned as deviant and breaking traditional codes of femininity. Holmila and Raitasalo (2005) assert that gender difference in alcohol-impaired driving behavior still remains largely unexplained, even though it may be linked with many aspects of biological differences between men and women, of gender-specific roles, and of ways in which environment regulate peoples' drinking.

Fourth, the findings indicate that the rate of impaired driving has increased among older samples (age between 55 and above), but has decreased among young people from 1991 to 2009. This finding raises questions whether there is a shift in age related impaired driving among Edmontonians in recent years. If so, what may have contributed to the increasing rate of impaired driving among this group of population? The current data do not allow for a plausible explanation on this issue. However, it may be that the current impaired driving policy target mostly the young people (e.g., graduate driver licensing, minimum legal drinking age laws etc.), but not the older ones. In addition, the cohort-effect may play a role in this context. It may be that the individuals aged 55 and older had had higher alcohol consumption rate when they were young, a trend that may have developed into alcohol-dependence continuing later in their life. Furthermore, the reason for the increased rate of impaired driving among individuals aged 55 and older may be due to the increased representation of older population and decreased representation of younger population in the Alberta Surveys in recent years. Finally, the rate of impaired driving has significantly declined (based on *z*-test for proportions) the most among the non-married, employed, religious respondents, those with post-secondary education, those with higher annual individual income, and those who live in a rented house.

#### **Limitations and Future Direction**

The current study has several limitations. The ethnic compositions in Alberta Survey represent large number of mixed-racial and Caucasian, and small number of non-Caucasian (Asians, aboriginals, and others) samples. Given the small number of cases for impaired driving in Alberta, conducting statistical analysis in identifying the differences within different ethnic groups is not feasible. It is important, however, to make such comparison to broadly understand the prevalence of impaired driving in the province. The results of this study should be interpreted with caution, because low response rate in 2009 Alberta Survey may have compromised the overall representativeness of the sample. However, low response rates in RDD studies do not necessarily cause non-response bias, and it is often not possible to determine whether a non-response bias exists (Groves, 2006; Keeter et al., 2000; Merkle & Edelman, 2002). Studies on non-response rates and non-response bias have shown that there is no strong association between non-response rates and non-response bias (Curtin, Presser, & Singer, 2000; Merkle & Edelman, 2002). To ensure minimization of bias due to non-response, up to ten callback attempts are made per sample. In addition, to ensure refusal rates are lowest, the respondents are informed that their responses will be kept completely confidential and anonymous, that the nature of the survey is non-commercial, and that the data is being collected in accordance with the Alberta Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act (Nurullah, 2010b).

The current study has left many questions unanswered. Future research should explore additional questions, for instance, why does impaired driving continue to prevail? Are drivers resorting to cannabis and other drugs, while reducing the use of alcohol? The next wave of the Canadian Addiction Survey and other surveys can shade light on such questions. Future studies should compare the rate of impaired driving among different ethnic groups in Alberta. To my knowledge, no study has focused on ethnic differences in the rate of impaired driving among Albertans so far. Ethnicity has been one of the factors linked to impaired driving in a few U.S. and Canadian studies (Asbridge, Payne, Cartwright, & Mann, 2010; Caetano & McGrath, 2005). In a representative sample of Ontario adults aged 18 and older who represented 19 distinct ethnic groups based on their self-identification of ethno-cultural heritage, Asbridge et al. (2010) find that relative to other ethnic groups, those adults who identify as Irish have a significantly higher rate of alcohol-impaired driving, while those of Italian and Chinese ethnicity have significantly lower rates of alcohol-impaired driving.

#### **Policy Implications**

Based on the findings of the study, several policy implications can be outlined. Although the rate of impaired driving is declining in recent years in Alberta, it still remains a major problem contributing to collision and injuries in the province. Policies should be directed towards gradually alleviating the problem. There is a gendered dimension in impaired driving. Although the rate of impaired driving has declined more among males (the rate of decline in females is lower), impaired driving still remains more prevalent among males than among females. Policies on reducing impaired driving should address this gendered nature of the phenomenon. A possible strategy is to target both males and females, rather than males only (which had been the sole target for impaired driving prevention, given that in all studies conducted so far, the behavior remains higher in males). Furthermore, implementing effective interventions to prevent binge drinking could substantially reduce alcohol-impaired driving (Flowers et al., 2008). Passengers of drinking drivers are at as much risk of a motor vehicle crash as the driver. However, the current legislation does not address the passengers of impaired drivers. Therefore, prevention efforts to reduce the rate of drinking and driving behavior should include passengers. The findings indicate that the use of designated drivers in Alberta remain literally unchanged for long. However, designated driving service is one of the most efficient strategies to reduce impaired driving, provided that the designated drivers remain sober when they perform their duty (Ditter et al., 2005). Therefore, the government of Alberta should take the initiative to improve the designated driving service in the province.

Acknowledgements: This paper is based in part on my MA Thesis. The research is supported by a REID (Research and Education on Impaired Driving) grant provided through the Department of Sociology at the University of Alberta. I'd like to thank Harvey Krahn, Michael Haan, and Cam Wild for their helpful suggestions and mentorship, and to the anonymous referees for their invaluable comments. An earlier version of this paper was presented at the *Canadian Sociological Association Annual Meeting* in Montréal, 31 May–04 June 2010.

**About the Author:** Abu Sadat Nurullah is currently a PhD candidate in Sociology at the University of Alberta. He has published in the *Journal of Communication Studies*, *Research in the Social Scientific Study of Religion, American Journal of Islamic Social Sciences*, and *International Journal of Interdisciplinary Social Sciences*, among others. His research interests include social problems, Islamic sociology, new media and society, and sociology of health and wellbeing. Direct correspondence to: Abu Sadat Nurullah, Department of Sociology, 5-21 Tory Building, University of Alberta, Edmonton, Alberta, T6G 2H4. E-mail: <u>nurullah@ualberta.ca</u>

## References

- Adebayo, A. (1991). Factors antecedent to impaired driving in a Canadian urban sample. *International Journal of the Addictions*, 26(8), 897-909.
- Adlaf, E. M., Mann, R. E., & Paglia, A. (2003). Drinking, cannabis use and driving among Ontario students. *Canadian Medical Association Journal*, *168*(5), 565-566.
- Adrian, M., Ferguson, B. S., & Her, M. (2001). Can alcohol price policies be used to reduce drunk driving? Evidence from Canada. *Substance Use & Misuse*, *36*(13), 1923-1957.
- Alberta Alcohol and Drug Abuse Commission. (2006). *Canadian Addiction Survey 2004: Alberta report*. Edmonton, Alberta, Canada: Author.
- Alberta Centre for Injury Control & Research (2009). Lowering the legal blood alcohol concentration for drivers. Retrieved on March 30, 2010, from http://www.acicr.ualberta.ca/documents/BAC PositionStatementDec09 References.pdf
- Alberta Transportation (2009). Alberta traffic collision statistics 2008. Retrieved on August 14, 2010, from http://www.transportation.alberta.ca/Content/docType47/Production/2008AR.pdf

Alberta Transportation (2003). Alberta traffic collision statistics 2002. Edmonton, AB: Government of Alberta. Retrieved on March 30, 2010, from

 $\underline{http://www.transportation.alberta.ca/Content/docType47/Production/2002AR.pdf}$ 

- Asbridge, M., Payne, E., Cartwright, J., & Mann, R. E. (2010). Driving under the influence of alcohol: Examining ethno-specific rates and the mediating effects of psychological distress and harmful and problematic drinking. *Accident Analysis & Prevention*, 42(4), 1408-1415.
- Babor, T. F., Caetano, R., Casswell, S., Edwards, G., Giesbrecht, N., Graham, K. et al. (2010). Alcohol: No ordinary commodity—Research and public policy (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). New York: Oxford University Press.
- Barr, A., & MacKinnon, D. P. (1998). Designated driving among college students. *Journal of Studies on Alcohol*, 59(5), 549-555.
- Bédard, M., Dubois, S., & Weaver, B. (2007). The Impact of Cannabis on Driving. *Canadian Journal of Public Health*, *98*(1), 6-11.
- Beirness, D. J., & Davis, C. G. (2007). Driving after drinking in Canada: Findings from the Canadian Addiction Survey. *Canadian Journal of Public Health*, *98*(6), 476-480.
- Beirness, D. J., Simpson, H. M., Mayhew, D. R., & Wilson, R. J. (1994). Trends in drinking driver fatalities in Canada. *Canadian Journal of Public Health*, 85(1), 19-22.
- Belton, K. L., Jhangri, G. S., MacDonald, S. D., & Voaklander, D. C. (2005). Nighttime impaired driving in rural Alberta. *Journal of Agricultural Safety and Health*, *11*(2), 135-140.
- Borges, G., Cherpitel, C., Orozco, R., Bond, J., Ye, Y., & Macdonald, S. (2006). Multicenter study of acute alcohol use and non-fatal injuries: Data from the WHO collaborative study on alcohol and injuries. *Bulletin of World Health Organization*, *84*(6), 453-460.
- Brennan, S., & Dauvergne, M. (2011). Police-reported crime statistics in Canada, 2010. *Juristat*, Statistics Canada catalogue no. 85-002-X. Ottawa: Canadian Centre for Justice Statistics, Statistics Canada.
- Caetano, R., & McGrath, C. (2005). Driving under the influence (DUI) among U.S. ethnic groups. *Accident Analysis & Prevention*, *37*(2), 217-224.
- Curtin, R., Presser, S., & Singer, E. (2000). The effects of response rate changes on the index of consumer sentiment. *Public Opinion Quarterly*, 64(4), 413-428.
- Danyluk, R., & Holmes, K. (2008). Development and implementation of the Alberta traffic safety plan community mobilization strategy. In *Proceedings of Canadian Multidisciplinary Road Safety Conference XVIII*, June 8-11. Whistler, BC: Canadian Association of Road Safety Professionals.
- Dellinger, A. M., Bolen, J., & Sacks, J. J. (1999). A comparison of driver- and passenger-based estimates of alcohol-impaired driving. *American Journal of Preventive Medicine*, *16*(4), 283-288.
- Desapriya, E., Pike, I., & Babul, S. (2006). Public attitudes, epidemiology and consequences of drinking and driving in British Columbia. *IATSS Research*, *30*(1), 101-110.
- Ditter, S. M., Elder, R. W., Shults, R. A., Sleet, D. A., Compton, R., & Nichols, J. L. (2005). Effectiveness of designated driver programs for reducing alcohol-impaired driving: A systematic review. American Journal of Preventative Medicine, 28(5, supplement 1), 280-287.
- Drixler, C., Krahn, H., & Wood, R. T. (2001). Teenage drinking and driving in rural Alberta. *Journal of Youth Studies*, *4*(1), 63-81.
- Eckardt, M., File, S., Gessa, G., Grant, K., Guerri, C., Hoffman, P. et al. (1998). Effects of moderate alcohol consumption on the central nervous system. *Alcoholism, clinical and experimental research*, 22(5), 998-1040.
- Elder, R., Shults, R., Sleet, D., Nichols, J. L., Thompson, R., & Rajab, W. (2004). Effectiveness of mass media campaigns for reducing drinking and driving and alcohol involved crashes. *American Journal of Preventive Medicine*, 27(1), 57-65.
- Elder, R. W., Shults, R. A., Sleet, D. A., Nichols, J. L., Zaza, S., & Thompson, R. S. (2002). Effectiveness of sobriety checkpoints for reducing alcohol-involved crashes. *Traffic Injury Prevention*, 3(4), 266-274.

- Flowers, N., Naimi, T. S., Brewer, R. D., Elder, R. W., Shults, R. A., & Jiles, R. (2008). Patterns of alcohol consumption and alcohol-impaired driving in the United States. *Alcoholism: Clinical and Experimental Research*, 32(4), 639-644.
- Foss, R. D., & Bierness, D. J. (1996). Drinking passengers and their drivers: Roadside survey results. In Association for the Advancement of Automotive Medicine, 40<sup>th</sup> Annual Proceedings, October 7-9, pp. 263-73. Vancouver, BC: AAAM.
- Gazso, A., & Krahn, H. (2008). Out of step or leading the parade? Public opinion about income support policy in Alberta, 1995 and 2004. *Journal of Canadian Studies*, 42(1), 154-178.
- Groves, R. M. (2006). Non-response rates and non-response bias in household surveys. *Public Opinion Quarterly*, 70(5), 646-675.
- Hartling, L., Wiebe, N., Russell, K., Petruk, J., Spinola, C., & Klassen, T. P. (2004). Graduated driver licensing for reducing motor vehicle crashes among young drivers. *The Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews*, 2. Art. No.: CD003300.pub2. doi: 10.1002/14651858.CD003300.pub2.
- Hasin, D., Paykin, A., Endicott, J., Grant, B. F. (1999). The validity of DSM-IV alcohol abuse: Drunk drivers versus all others. *Journal of Studies on Alcohol*, 60(6), 746-755.
- Hingson, R. W., Zha, W., & Weitzman, E. R. (2009). Magnitude of and trends in alcohol-related mortality and morbidity among U.S. college students ages 18-24, 1998-2005. *Journal of Studies* on Alcohol and Drugs, S16, 12-20.
- Holmila, M., & Raitasalo, K. (2005). Gender differences in drinking: Why do they still exist? *Addiction*, *100*(12), 1763-1769.
- Howard Research. (2005). *Evaluation of the Alberta Administrative Licence Suspension program*. Calgary and Edmonton: Author.
- Isaac, N. E., Kennedy, B., & Graham, J. D. (1995). Who's in the car? Passengers as potential interveners in alcohol-involved fatal crashes. *Accident Analysis & Prevention*, 27(2), 159-165.
- Keeter, S., Miller, C., Kohut, A., Groves, R. M., & Presser, S. (2000). Consequences of reducing nonresponse in a national telephone survey. *Public Opinion Quarterly*, 64(2), 125-148.
- Lahaut, V. M., Jansen, H. A., van de Mheen, D., Garretsen, H. F., Verdurmen, J. E., & van Dijk, A. (2003). Estimating non-response bias in a survey on alcohol consumption: Comparison of response waves. *Alcohol and Alcoholism*, 38(2), 128-134.
- Leadbeater, B. J., Foran, K., & Grove-White, A. (2008). How much can you drink before driving? The influence of riding with impaired adults and peers on the driving behaviors of urban and rural youth. *Addiction*, *103*(4), 629-637.
- Lyons, A. C., & Willott, S. A. (2008). Alcohol consumption, gender identities and women's changing social positions. *Sex Roles*, 59(9-10), 694-712.
- Marelich, W. D., Berger, D. E., & McKenna, R. B. (2000). Gender differences in the control of alcoholimpaired driving in California. *Journal of Studies on Alcohol*, 61(3), 396-401.
- Marques, P. R. (2009). The alcohol ignition interlock and other technologies for the prediction and control of impaired drivers. In J. C. Verster, S. R. Pandi-Perumal, J. G. Ramaekers, & J. J. de Gier, (Eds.), *Drugs, driving and traffic safety* (pp. 457-476). Basel, Switzerland: Birkhauser Verlag.
- Mayhew, D. R., Simpson, H. M., & Singhal, D. (2005). *Best practices for graduated driver licensing in Canada*. Ottawa, ON: Traffic Injury Research Foundation.
- McCartt, A. T., Mayhew, D. R., Braitman, K. A., Ferguson, S. A., & Simpson, H. M. (2009). Effects of age and experience on young driver crashes: Review of recent literature. *Traffic Injury Prevention*, 10(3), 209-219.
- McNeil, P., & Webster, I. (1997). *Canada's alcohol and other drugs survey 1994: A discussion of the findings*. Ottawa: Minister of Public Works and Government Services Canada.
- Merkle, D., & Edelman, M. (2002). Non-response in exit polls: A comprehensive analysis. In R. M. Groves, D. A. Dillman, J. L. Eltinge, & R. J. A. Little (Eds.), *Survey non-response* (pp. 243-258). New York: Wiley.

- Nurullah, A. S. (2010a). Social influence in impaired driving: An exploration in Alberta, Canada. *International Journal of Interdisciplinary Social Sciences*, 5(3), 447-464.
- Nurullah, A. S. (2010b). *The prevalence of alcohol-impaired driving in Alberta*. M.A. Thesis, Department of Sociology, University of Alberta.
- O'malley, P., & Johnston, L. (1999). Drinking and driving among US high school seniors, 1984-1997. *American Journal of Public Health*, 89(5), 678-684.
- Peck, R. C., Gebers, M. A., Voas, R. B., & Romano, E. (2008). The relationship between blood alcohol concentration (BAC), age, and crash risk. *Journal of Safety Research*, *39*(3), 311-319.
- Peng, C. J., Lee, K. L., & Ingersoll, G. M. (2002). An introduction to logistic regression analysis and reporting. *Journal of Educational Research*, 96(1), 3-15.
- Poulin, C., Boudreau, B., & Ashbridge, M. (2006). Adolescent passengers of drunk drivers: A multi-level exploration into the inequities of risk and safety. *Addiction*, *102*(1), 51-61.
- Rehm, J., Room, R., Graham, K., Monteiro, M., Gmel, G., & Sempos, C. (2003). The relationship of average volume of alcohol consumption and patterns of drinking to burden of disease: An overview. *Addiction*, 98(9), 1209-1228.
- Schwartz, J. (2008). Gender differences in drunk driving prevalence rates and trends: A 20-year assessment using multiple sources of evidence. *Addictive Behaviors*, 33(9), 1217-1222.
- Shope, J. T. (2007). Graduated driver licensing: Review of evaluation results since 2002. Journal of Safety Research, 38(2), 165-175.
- Shults, R. A., Kresnow, M., & Lee, K. C. (2009). Driver- and passenger-based estimates of alcoholimpaired driving in the U.S., 2001-2003. American Journal of Preventive Medicine, 36(6), 515-522.
- Shults, R. A., Elder, R. W., Sleet, D. A., Nichols, J. L., Alao, M. O., & Carande-Kulis, V. G., et al. (2001). Reviews of evidence regarding interventions to reduce alcohol impaired driving. *American Journal of Preventive Medicine*, 21 (4, supplement 1), 66-88.
- Simpson, H. M., Mayhew, D. R., & Beirness, D. J. (1992). *National survey on drinking and driving 1988: Technical report*. Ottawa: Health and Welfare Canada and Transport Canada.
- Soderstrom, C. A., Dischinger, P. C., & Kerns, T. J. (1996). Alcohol use among injured sets of drivers and passengers. *Accident Analysis & Prevention*, 28(1), 111-114.
- Solomon, R., & Chamberlain, E. (2010, January 5). MADD report suggests that Alberta's traffic safety laws need improvement. Retrieved on March 29, 2010, from http://www.madd.ca/english/news/stories/n20100105.htm
- Stockwell, T., Sturge, J., & Jones, W. (2006). Cannabis use in British Columbia: Patterns of use, perceptions, and public opinion as assessed in the 2004 Canadian Addiction Survey. Victoria: Centre for Addictions Research of British Columbia.
- Tourangeau, R. (2004). Survey research and societal change. Annual Review of Psychology, 55, 775-801.
- Transport Canada. (2008, November). A quick look at alcohol-related crashes in Canada (Report no. TP 2436 E). Ontario: Transport Canada. Retrieved on August 27, 2010, from http://www.tc.gc.ca/roadsafety/tp/tp2436/rs200809/menu.htm
- Vanlaar, W., Robertson, R., Marcoux, K., Mayhew, D., Brown, S., & Boase, P. (2012). Trends in alcoholimpaired driving in Canada. Accident Analysis & Prevention, 48, 297-302.
- Vanlaar, W., Marcoux, K., & Robertson, R. (2009). The road safety monitor 2009: Drinking and driving in Canada. Ottawa: Traffic Injury Research Foundation.
- Wallace, M. (2009). Police-reported crime statistics in Canada, 2008. *Juristat*, 29(3), Catalogue no. 85-002-X. Ottawa: Canadian Centre for Justice Statistics, Statistics Canada.
- Wechsler, H., Lee, J. E., Nelson, T. F., & Lee, H. (2003). Drinking and driving among college students: The influence of alcohol-control policies. *American Journal of Preventive Medicine*, 25(3), 212-218.
- Wilson, R. J. (1984). A national household survey on drinking and driving. Ottawa: Road Safety and Motor Vehicle Directorate, Transport Canada.



# From Frayed Rope to Tight Strings: Negotiating Non-Profit Governance in a Neoliberal State

# Casey Ready, Ph.D.

Trent University, Frost Centre for Canadian Studies and Indigenous Studies

Neoliberal policies have created economic disparities and increased the gap between the rich and the poor in Canada. The Mulroney government initiated neoliberal revisions to the Canadian social welfare state as it quietly changed complex regulations that impacted the welfare and wellbeing of Canadians. This government worked "by stealth" and with little consultation to dismantle key components of the social welfare state, while publicly pronouncing its sacred value. In Ontario, neoliberal policies are identified with the Harris government's visible and public attack on the poor, on women and on those marginalized by race. The Harris government made significant cuts to services offered by non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and, in particular, to women's organizations and advocacy groups. This paper examines the impact of neoliberalism by exploring changes through such policies in the relationship between the state and non-profit organizations in Ontario. It is based on initial findings from qualitative research conducted in 2010 and 2011 with three YWCA organizations. It characterizes a shift from the way NGO-state relationships were depicted by Katherine Scott in 2003 as a "frayed rope" about to break, to being represented by an image of multiple "tight strings." This research forms part of a dissertation examining how the neoliberal policies that have reduced government support for, and downloaded responsibilities to, the non-profit sector have affected the capacity of community-based women's organizations to implement a feminist agenda in their work with women. The timeframe studied, from 2003 to 2008, builds on the now extensive scholarly research on the impact of neoliberal policies that occurred from 1995 to 2003, the years led by Progressive Conservative Premiers Mike Harris and Ernie Eves. It closely examines continuities and discontinuities between the two governments, revealing many dangers for women buried in complex and often misunderstood relationships between non-profit organizations and the state.

Key words: Feminism; neoliberalism; social welfare state; non-profit sector; violence against women; gendered poverty

Des politiques néolibérales ont donné lieu à des disparités économiques et augmenté l'écart entre les riches et les pauvres du Canada. Le gouvernement Mulroney a entrepris des modifications néolibérales de l'État social providence, et changé des règlements complexes se répercutant sur le bien-être et la qualité de vie des Canadiens. Ce gouvernement a agi furtivement et sans mener de vastes consultations sur le démantèlement des composantes essentielles de l'État social providence, tout en déclarant publiquement sa valeur sacrée. En Ontario, des politiques néolibérales caractérisent l'attaque ouverte et publique menée par le gouvernement Harris contre les démunis, les femmes et les personnes marginalisées par la race. Le gouvernement Harris a fait des coupures significatives dans les services offerts par les organismes non gouvernementaux (ONG), particulièrement les groupes de défense des droits de la femme et les regroupements de femmes. Cette étude porte sur les répercussions du néolibéralisme en se penchant sur les changements apportés par de telles politiques à la relation entre l'État et les organismes à but non lucratif de l'Ontario. Elle est fondée sur les conclusions primaires d'une recherche qualitative menée en 2010 et 2011 auprès de trois organismes de la YWCA faisant une distinction dans la relation entre les ONG et l'État qui, décrite par Katherine Scott en 2003 comme une « corde usée » sur le point de se rompre, s'était détériorée en de multiples « cordons serrés ». Cette étude s'inscrit dans une dissertation portant sur les politiques

néolibérales ayant réduit la participation du gouvernement au secteur des organismes à but non lucratif, ainsi que sa délégation constante de ses responsabilités sur ce dernier, et ayant diminué la capacité des organisations communautaires de femmes à mettre en œuvre un agenda féminisme dans le cadre de leurs activités auprès des femmes. La période à l'étude, en l'occurrence 2003 à 2008, s'appuie sur de vastes recherches académiques portant sur l'impact des politiques néolibérales mises en œuvre de 1995 à 2003, années au cours desquelles les Premiers ministres progressistes conservateurs Mike Harris et Ernie Eves étaient au pouvoir. Y sont analysées en détails les différences et la continuité entre les deux gouvernements en et relève de nombreux dangers pour les femmes, dissimulés dans des rapports complexes et souvent mal compris entre les organismes à but non lucratif et l'État.

**Mots-clés :** féminisme; néolibéralisme; État providence social; secteur à but non lucratif; violence faite aux femmes; différence dans la pauvreté des hommes et des femmes

#### Introduction

Neoliberalism is a complex project. It values individual freedom and privileges the primacy of the market over collective claims to welfare, as it proffers the belief that the primary role of the state is to protect and nourish market growth and entrepreneurialism (Harvey, 2005). Neoliberal policies have created economic disparities and increased the gap between the rich and the poor in Canada. Susan Braedley and Meg Luxton (2010) argue that neoliberalism "...is not advancing social justice or equality, but is, instead, re-inscribing, intensifying, and creating injustices and inequality" (p. 6). In particular, they show that it is creating and extending the poverty of women and of people marginalized by race. By valuing individual responsibility, neoliberalism fosters blame-the-victim thinking. It has led to women having lower wages and more unpaid work than men, as it has promoted the interests of elite men in maintaining gendered divisions of labour and male privilege (Braedley and Luxton, 2010, p. 15).

This paper examines how three YWCA organizations in Ontario experienced the McGuinty government's new-neoliberal violence against women policies from 2003 to 2008 as continuing, and differing from, the neoliberal policies presented by the Harris-Eves governments from 1995 to 2003. It focuses on the relationship between the YWCAs as non-profit organizations, or NGOs, and the government with the goal of uncovering ways these relationships, and changes in them, affect women served by and working in the YWCAs. It reveals many dangers for women buried in complex and often misunderstood relationships between non-profit organizations and the state, including continuing dangers for women served by, and working in, the YWCAs during the years studied of the McGuinty government.

This paper examines changes in the relationship between the state and non-profit organizations (NGOs) based on initial findings from research conducted in 2010 and 2011 with three YWCA organizations in Ontario. This research forms part of a dissertation examining how neoliberal policies, which reduced government support for and downloaded responsibilities to the non-profit sector, have affected the capacity of the YWCAs to implement a feminist agenda in their work with women. The timeframe studied, from 2003 to 2008, builds on the now extensive scholarly research (Bashevkin, 2002; Chunn & Gavigan, 2004; Little, 2003; Miller, 1998; OAITH, 1996, 1998; Scott, 2003) on the impact of neoliberal policies that occurred from 1995 to 2003, the years led by Progressive Conservative Premiers Mike Harris and Ernie Eves.

Findings in this paper are drawn from interviews and focus groups in 2010 and 2011 with forty-one people, including clients, staff and volunteers of the YWCAs and representatives of government and of activist groups. Findings also include data from a literature review and a review of documents from three YWCAs, the Ontario government and activist groups. They reveal ways the YWCAs experienced pressures in their connections with neoliberal governments and, in particular, changes in these relationships in the shift from the Harris government, known for its extreme funding cuts and direct attacks on women, to the McGuinty government. While the McGuinty government brought some relief to the YWCAs and lessened the ideological war on women initiated by the Harris government, this research

suggests that it did not immediately offer significant new funds to the violence-against-women sector. Funding increases during the McGuinty government's first term were minimal. It was only in its second term, following significant advocacy by the violence-against-women sector, that the McGuinty government allocated meaningful funding increases to the YWCAs. Findings further reveal that this new funding came with a clear neoliberal twist. I characterize changes in this relationship as a shift from Katherine Scott's 2003 depiction of the NGO-state relationship as a "frayed rope" to it being represented instead by an image of multiple "tight strings". Scott's frayed rope suggests a single and strong relationship between the state and the non-profit sector. This strength as a thick rope was eroded by funding cuts and regulation changes through neoliberal governments, to the point that it was badly frayed and about to break.

The image of multiple tight strings portrays funds re-invested from the state to the non-profit sector by new-neoliberal governments through a number of new, specific and closely monitored service contracts. The number of strings represents the multiplicity of relationships between NGOs and the state created by these contracts. Their tightness underscores how funds were invested in the non-profit sector with the new expectations and heightened accountability requirements of the McGuinty administration. This image corresponds with research claiming that new-neoliberal or social investment governments, such as the McGuinty Liberals, offer new funds for services but with high levels of state regulation and accountability as these funds are "reinserted in new ways" (Chunn and Gavigan, 2004, p.227). The tautness of the strings portrays tensions created by a pull-back from NGOs receiving and also resisting conditions on these newly invested funds. In the case of the YWCAs, this resistance was strengthened by their feminist goals and agendas as they negotiated funding agreements to meet the needs of the women they serve.

The Canadian social welfare state expanded significantly in post-World War II following key assumptions held by British economist John Maynard Keynes that the state had a role to play in addressing the failures of the market. The Keynesian social welfare state was marked by growth in areas such as health, education, social welfare and income security programs (Cossman and Fudge, 2002, p. 10). Governments with neoliberal agendas began to dismantle key components of the Keynesian social welfare in the mid-1970s. The Mulroney government began a large scale, but initially quiet, project of dismantling the social welfare state following the 1985 report of the Macdonald Commission and the subsequent 1988 Free Trade Agreement. This included selling state assets, cutting funding for social programs and attacking advocacy groups representing women, people of colour, and First Nations (Cossman and Fudge, 2002, p. 14). Cuts to the social welfare state were accelerated by the Chrétien government as it eliminated the Canada Assistance Plan (CAP) and the Established Program Financing Act (EPFA) and reduced spending on health and social services by 7 billion dollars from 1995 to 1997 (Cossman and Fudge, 2002, p. 16). In Ontario, neoliberal policies dismantling the social welfare state are identified with the Harris government's visible and public attack on the poor, on women and on those marginalized by race. The Harris government made significant cuts to services offered by NGOs and, in particular, to women's organizations and advocacy groups.

The policies of the McGuinty government are said to share some assumptions of the more classic neoliberalism of the previous Harris government, but to also bring new features more consistent with "centre-left" governments. Scholars have defined such governments as "social investment," "Third Way," "new-neoliberal," "post-neoliberal," "contingent neoliberal" and "roll-out neoliberal" states (Dobrowolsky, 2002, 2009; Hackworth, 2008). The term "new-neoliberal" is used in this paper as it reflects the continuation of key tenets of neoliberalism while also suggesting that some aspects of neoliberalism are new or changed.

#### **Methods and Theory**

Research for this study includes a literature review; examination of publicly available documents from the Ontario government, the YWCAs and violence-against-women activist groups. Interviews and focus groups with 41 volunteers, staff and clients of three YWCAs, representatives of the Ontario government,

and activists were conducted. Findings are reported in direct or block quotations, reflecting the actual words of participants. Trends, conclusions and comparisons drawn from this research reflect my own views and may not be shared by the people interviewed.

The interviews and focus groups followed a written set of questions approved by Trent University's Research Ethics Board. Interviews were conducted in a semi-structured format. Questions were designed to seek comments on the broader themes and issues guiding this work related to the impact of neoliberalism on the feminist agenda of the YWCAs. They varied slightly in length for the interviews (Appendix 1), focus groups (Appendix 2) and external interviews held with the government representatives and activists (Appendix 3). Interviews were recorded, with participant consent. Notes from focus groups were kept on flip charts. I analysed all transcribed notes by coding them as containing content in relation to the research questions. In total, comments were coded and sorted into nine areas of content: (1) the Harris government, (2) the McGuinty government, (3) feminism, (4) NGO/state relationships, (5) funding, (6) fundraising, (7) advocacy, (8) work and, (9) professionalization.

Two central questions explored were: (1) how the three YWCAs experienced the McGuinty government's first term violence-against-women policies as continuing and differing from, the neoliberal assumptions presented by the Harris government and, (2) how these YWCAs defined and negotiated a feminist agenda in their violence-against-women work in response to this government. The term, a feminist agenda, referred to ways that feminist beliefs influenced and were incorporated in the work of the YWCAs. Participants in the study were asked questions (as shown in Appendices 1, 2 and 3) about the feminist agenda of the YWCAs and the subsequent impact of the Harris and McGuinty government. Findings reported in this paper were frequently cited by participants in response to questions about ways that their services were most affected by neoliberalism, areas where they felt their YWCA work would, and would not, be defined as feminist, and strategies their YWCAs put in place to respond to government changes.

This research is situated in political economy theories that place the social welfare state in a legitimating role within a broader capital state (Offe, 1984). It draws on understandings of the social welfare state that view governments to have complex and often contradictory functions, following theories that "a great deal of state policy...[is] directed at moderating the glare of the inequalities of capitalism" and at legitimizing state actions (Panitch, 1977, p. 228). It builds on a view of the history of social welfare in Ontario which uncovered a "galling paradox" of increasing welfare dependency in the midst of plenty (Struthers, 1994, p. 258). Further, it extends an understanding that that the social welfare state supports concepts of a "social minimum" and "less eligibility" (Chunn & Gavigan, 2004; Little, 2003; Struthers, 1994) in that supports received from the state must always be lower than what is needed, or never be enough, in order to keep people working for minimal wages. The social welfare state operating within a capitalist state faces inconsistencies and paradoxes as it is designed to support the accumulation of capital and to also maintain the legitimacy of the state (Offe, 1984; Panitch, 1977). This understanding makes visible obscure connections and interdependencies between the social welfare state and capitalism. It supports contentions that the social welfare state in a modern capital society has a "permanent legitimation problem" and exists in a constant state of crisis through its contradictory roles (Offe, 1984, p. 23). Contradictions in state roles can be seen in tensions between a stated goal of supporting women and children in contrast to unstated goals of regulating women's morality and behaviour, as shown in the treatment of single mothers through Mothers' Allowance programs (Little, 2003).

I share a concern that there has been a retreat from class analysis in the academy connected with the shift to postmodern theories and that this retreat is "one of neoliberalism's most effective ideological weapons" (Naples, 2003, p. 69, quoting Rosemary Hennessy). Deeper connections are needed between academic and activist work, including renewed emphasis on class-based analysis in research, to aid efforts to expose and resist neoliberal policies that increase poverty, inequality, and the marginalization of women. With this concern, this research draws on feminist standpoint theory that places importance on the material and the concrete, as well as on *praxis* (Naples, 2003), and builds bridges between modern and postmodern theories. The approach for this study draws on theories that value differing and changing

perspectives from the situated knowledges and multiple standpoints of women (Harstock, 1996; Hesse-Biber& Leavey, 2007). It is informed by feminist research theory contending that both discursive research methodologies and those based on more concrete, material matters are valid and that the combination of these can overcome challenges in activist research (Naples, 2003). The struggle to combine views from practical, material studies of the social welfare state with postmodern theories that examine governmentality and the relations of ruling enriches this research (Rose, O'Malley, & Valverde, 2006; Smith, 2005).

#### Results

This study of the three YWCAs reveals a changing relationship between them and the state. It characterizes this relationship as representing a shift from the NGO-state relationship depicted by Scott (2003) as a frayed rope, to an image of this relationship found in the current research to now be better reflected as one of multiple tight strings.

The argument for this research is that the alliance between feminism and neoliberalism in the work of the YWCAs during the time studied was complex and at times uneasy due to contradictions between feminism and neoliberalism. It was also anticipated that the funding and policy approaches for the YWCA violence-against-women programs by the new-neoliberal McGuinty government would mirror, in many ways, those of the Harris government. Initial findings confirm and diverge from this argument.

The negative impact of the policies and funding of the Harris government on the violenceagainst-women programs of the YWCAs was confirmed by study participants and in documents reviewed. However, the findings differ from those anticipated where they demonstrate that the McGuinty government's approach did not mirror that of the Harris government. There were significant and subtle funding and policy changes affecting the shelter work of the YWCAs under McGuinty. An immediate shift took place in the first term of the McGuinty government as they displayed more women-friendly attitudes, including increasing consultations with women in the violence-against-women sector. Yet there were only minor, if welcome, funding improvements during McGuinty's first term, such as renewed cost of living increases. In the first year of their second term, following a strong lobby by violence-againstwomen advocates through the Step it Up Campaign, the McGuinty government returned funds cut by the Harris government in 1995. Also, it released its Domestic Violence Action Plan, offering increased funds for a new Transitional Housing Support Program. It took concerted advocacy and negotiation by women's groups, including but not exclusively the YWCAs, to bring about the significant funding enhancements in McGuintv's second term. Even with communications and funding improvements, policies of the McGuinty government still reflected neoliberal values and the struggles experienced in the violence against women sector were not over.

#### Shift from Keynesian to Neoliberal Social Welfare State

The Keynesian social welfare state has been systematically reduced in Canada since the mid-1970s through the implementation of neoliberal policies. Marjorie Cohen (1997) documents the deconstruction of social welfare through federal funding cuts from 1985 to 1995, including significant cuts to advocacy, women's and citizen's groups. Changes made by the Harris government were consistent with neoliberal policies of privatization, familialization, decentralization, commodification and criminalization (Bezanson, 2006). Changes implemented by this government to welfare policies began immediately following their 1995 election with cuts of 5.5 billion dollars in funding from almost all ministries, agencies and not-for-profit agencies (Bezanson, 2006). The Harris government attacked Ontario's social assistance programs materially and ideologically (Little, 2003). These attacks came in the form of: (1) benefit rates were cut by 21.6%, (2) spouse-in-the-house regulations abolished in 1987 were reintroduced, (3) a separate provincial program of Family Benefit Assistance (FBA) targeted principally at single
mothers was eliminated, and (4) a new system of eligibility based on compulsory workfare and job training for all employable recipients was implemented (Little, 2003).

Although it was assumed that neoliberal policies would soften with the shift to new Third Way governments, such as that of McGuinty, these new regimes did not move away from neoliberalism. Sylvia Bashevkin (2002) describes this as a "puzzle" in the policies of Third Way politicians in Canada, the United States and Britain (p. 4). Bashevkin examines the policies of governments led by Tony Blair, Bill Clinton and Jean Chrétien, who were defined as post-conservative leaders but found to pursue "fundamentally similar or even more regressive policy directions" than their neoliberal predecessors (Bashevkin, 2002, p. 4). Bashevkin argues that Third Way politicians such as Chretien adopted rhetoric about family values, single mothers and poverty, but with significantly different meanings than feminist discourse about care-giving and nurturing. She describes this strategy as employing the "same terms for very different purposes" (Bashevkin, 2002, p. 141).

#### "Harris Lingered On"

A growing body of research examines changes in the shift from the neoliberal policies of the Harris government to those of the McGuinty government. While the McGuinty government reframed rhetoric about neoliberalism and reinstated some funding, it continued to operate under neoliberal assumptions. Studies on social housing found that while centre-left governments such as the McGuinty government seldom espouse or "foreground neoliberal principles" (Hackworth, 2008, p. 4), they remain effective in maintaining neoliberalism in their policies and practices. By using rhetoric more friendly or favourable to social housing, while still implementing neoliberal policies that limited the development of social housing, new-neoliberal governments were found to also effectively mute activism (Hackworth, 2008).

The negative impacts of the Harris government's neoliberal policies continued during both terms of the McGuinty government. One of the activists interviewed cited this as a reflection that "Harris lingered on." This lingering on allowed the McGuinty government to appear softer in its policies and funding, while anti-feminist policies and discourses affecting violence-against-women services created by the Harris government continued to have a negative impact on women. As many of the people interviewed were not familiar with the term neoliberalism, it is interpreted in this study that the statement that Harris lingered on also meant that *neoliberalism lingered on* under the McGuinty government.

#### From Frayed Rope to Tight Strings

Parallel with services provided directly by governments through the social welfare state in Canada and significantly part of the social welfare state, are services offered by NGOs. This sector emerged in Canada in the late 19<sup>th</sup> century with a relationship to the state characterized as "uneasy" and "fraught with tension" (Brock, 2001, p. 264). The non-profit sector and NGOs grew significantly in Canada with funding provided during the expansion of the post-war Keynesian social welfare state such as the development of children's aid societies in the late 19<sup>th</sup> century - the first private organizations to deliver statutory government programs (Miller, 1998). They flourished in the 1960s and 1970s with the Pearson government establishing groups to foster citizen participation and increasing government grants, and through Trudeau's promotion of a just society (Miller, 1998). Overall, Canadian registered charities tripled from 1960 to 1990 (Miller, 1998). Cuts since then in core funding and a shift to contracts and grants by neoliberal governments led this sector to suffer a crisis of identity as it became more state-driven, hindering its ability to act independently on behalf of citizens (Miller, 1998).

The impact of neoliberalism on the work of a non-profit organization is examined by Susan Arai and Donald Reid in a study assessing the effects of funding cuts through the Harris government's Bill 26 (the Omnibus Bill) on the social planning council in Ottawa (Arai & Reid, 2003). Arai and Reid conclude that cuts to the social planning council's funding led not only to a loss of community service but also to a significant loss of volunteer advocacy roles and opportunities for social citizenship. Due to reduced funding, the social planning council was pressured to be involved with direct services, such as food

banks, breakfast programs and other band aid-type programs, and was thereby less involved with its mandated work of social research, evaluation and advocacy on systemic issues of poverty. Fewer volunteers were recruited and trained to undertake higher level community service roles as more were recruited for technical and menial volunteer roles. These changes limited the possibilities for the social planning council to engage in social development and advocacy work as volunteer roles shifted to support the direct service tasks.

Restructuring of the social welfare state that began in the 1970s has moved the non-profit sector increasingly to the role of a shadow state or a para-state apparatus (Milligan & Conradson, 2006; Wolch, 1990):

The shadow state carries out welfare state functions, providing essential human services, financial and in-kind benefits, and surveillance of clients. In these activities, it is enabled, regulated and subsidized by the state. But shadow activities are not formally part of the state. They do not involve the same kinds of direct accountability and oversight procedures characteristic of internal state apparatus. Instead, they are subject to state-imposed direct and indirect constraints on their autonomy (Wolch, 1990, p. 41).

Scott (2003) depicted the relationship of NGOs to the state as a deeply frayed rope, about to break. The non-profit sector faced pressures created by the shift from core funding to short-term, project and contract-based funding, from the strain of increased reporting and accountability requirements, and from heightened expectations that they would engage in partnerships. NGOs were left hanging to the state by a frayed rope through increased funding volatility, loss of infrastructure, reporting overloads, an advocacy chill, a human resource chill and an overall situation likened to being a "house of cards" (Scott, 2003, p. xiv-xv).

The Harris government initiated funding changes that had an immediate impact on the YWCAs, their shelter work and their clients. Described as "cuts to the bone" in shelter services, they implemented a five percent overall cut to first stage emergency shelters for abused women, the elimination of counselling and advocacy programs in women's second stage housing and cuts to community counselling and crisis telephone services for abused women (OAITH, 1998). These occurred at the same time as women were deeply affected by the Harris government's cuts to the social welfare state, cuts that were gendered in that they affected women more than men. These included the 21.6% cut in social assistance noted above as well as cuts to legal aid and family law, narrowed eligibility for social assistance, cuts to child care spaces, cuts to training and education for women, and the elimination of funding to key advocacy groups such as OAITH and tenants rights groups (OAITH, 1998). The current study contains responses by women involved with the three YWCAs to the policies and funding of the Harris government, with findings showing almost unanimous agreement that this constituted a war on women and on the shelter services of the YWCAs. In a YWCA staff focus group, participants emphasized that it was clearly a very difficult time, one they referred to as "desperate", though not without room available for advocacy and agency by the YWCAs.

These findings follow arguments that changes to the social welfare state through neoliberal policies are "explicitly gendered" even as they claim a "gender-neutral" position (Bezanson, 2006, p. 36). Neoliberalism is gendered as it de-funds women's organizations, marginalizes women's activist groups, and appropriates feminist discourse for its own ends. Neoliberal changes shift responsibilities from the state to the market and the family, pressuring women into "taking up the slack for cuts in social services and for labour market insecurity" (Bezanson, 2006, p. 36).

The shift to the McGuinty government was viewed by an Executive Director of a YWCA as an "enormous relief," bringing great hope to the people working at the YWCAs. The YWCAs experienced an immediate change in attitude and communications from the new government. Participants said that they felt valued for their work; they were consulted and felt that the government atmosphere was much more woman-friendly. Some new money flowed to the YWCAs during this time, but the increases were minimal and did not restore the funding lost through cuts by the Harris government. According to an

interviewed advocate, it was only in the second term of the McGuinty government, following concerted province-wide advocacy, that significant funds were reinstated to the YWCAs and the shelters.

Diversities were found in the relationships between the YWCAs and the Ontario government. Each YWCA had a personal and individual relationship with their Ontario government funders based on their own approach and connections. Yet similarities also existed in the relationships between the YWCAs and the government. They all experienced heightened expectations to produce reports on government defined service outcomes. They also experienced tensions as they worked to serve women who were experiencing ongoing pressures of poverty. They reported pressures from changing expectations in the relationship between the government and their Executive Directors; increased reporting and accountability requirements; demands on working conditions for women; requirements for salary freezes; and heightened expectations for fundraising.

The YWCAs experienced a sudden openness in their relationships with the Ontario government with the shift to the McGuinty government. One Executive Director stated, "suddenly we seemed to have a government that actually did care. They sent people out to do the research and to do the thinking, who obviously did get it." Another Executive Director commented on this as well, noting:

Well, certainly the rhetoric changed. Certainly, the government, the M.P.P.s and bureaucrats were more open, they would meet with the social service sector, which had not happened for a very long time. So the whole approach changed, it was a way friendlier environment...you know for the first time in four or five years, the government was welcoming and that was an enormous relief. Even if they weren't able to do things right away that they were willing to hear what you had to say was a blessed relief.

#### Pressures from the "New Public Managerialism"

Theories of governmentality and the relations of ruling reveal ways of assessing how the state can appear to limit its size and withdraw its involvement from services while in reality it is still "governing from a distance" through regulations that are dispersed and often hard to recognise (Rose, O'Malley & Valverde, 2006, p. 95). Though the "new public managerialism" powers held by the state appear benign, as they are hidden among diffuse, grey and boring procedures, while in fact they have a powerful hold on the experiences of NGOs (Smith, 2005, p. 217). The increased reporting and tight accountability expectations initiated by the Harris government continued and even increased with the McGuinty government. These marked a shift to corporate governance and accountability mechanisms, such as a reliance on evidence-based research and outcomes-based measurement systems, a shift seen as a "misfit" with the work of community organizations (Bonisteel & Green, 2005, p. 22). Tensions between neoliberalism and feminism are embedded in differing methods of accountability and evaluation (Bonisteel & Green, 2005). Neoliberalism favours evaluations based on positivist science and its claims to neutrality, objectivity, and experimental research; alternately, feminist research evaluation values "ways of knowing the world that are rooted in the experience of women" (Bonisteel & Green, 2005, p. 23). Reflexivity, the social location of the researcher and the participation of research participants are important to feminist research. Power shifted with the new public managerialism, as "knowledge production [was]...untied from the community and re-tied to the powerful institutions that are authorized to generate it, such as governments, universities, hospitals and funders" (Bonisteel & Green, 2005, p. 25).

These forms of accountability and evaluation construct many of the tight strings in the relationship between the YWCAs and the government. They define how services are provided, creating tensions and even tighter strings. One YWCA staff member referred to these processes as reflective of "robotic thinking":

There's now a huge administration burden on organizations, without the dollars, because we've never, you know, we're slim in terms of resources. We're spending a lot of time now doing, the dot the i's and cross the t's, and trying to make a woman tell us [what we want to hear] so that we can get

the funding...there's a lot more paperwork...they're trying to get so fine tuned that it's not going to make any sense, I call it robotic thinking.

Accountability mechanisms shaped the services provided by the YWCAs and created tensions in the ways they responded to the needs of women served. This was illustrated in an example described as "creaming," where government requirements for reports on successful services impacted the way one of the YWCA offered services, reducing access to services for the women who needed them the most. The Executive Director of this YWCA cited this in relation to an employment program, but it is relevant to the current study on violence-against-women services as it demonstrates the effects of outcome measures on programming. Her comments were:

So, instead of having a program that will help women with many barriers to getting employment funded on a block basis, an annual block grant, they have moved to an outcomes way of paying. So, our conviction is that that way of funding, when you only pay for outcomes, leads our whole sector, not us, our whole sector, to do what is called "creaming."... so, you really want to work with the people who are the most close to getting a job, so that when they get that job, you're paid. So the women that we work with have multiple barriers to employment - and it might take a year of intensive working with them for them to get a job, as opposed to working with someone for a month who gets a job. And yet, for all the work that we do for a year, we may get paid, but we may not. They may have advanced tremendously but they still don't have that job.

In a second example of the impact of accountability measures on service delivery, one of the YWCA staff participants spoke of "the need to rescue women." The reference to rescuing women was an interpretation by this staff member based on the reports their YWCA submitted to the government. The government wanted them to account for the number of women they freed from violent situations. This requirement placed this organization in a strained relationship with the government as it called on them to work in ways that moved them away from their feminist values. The requirement for this YWCA to demonstrate they had rescued or saved women contradicted their feminist agenda to have women define their own options and plans. A staff member said:

That's always been a bit of a struggle given that statistics, a lot of the government folks or funders that want statistics are looking for, you know, how we impacted women, assuming that there's more of a rescue – that we saved her from this, that we saved her from that, and it really isn't us, it's really the woman. So looking at building her strengths is basically how we work with women – help her find them, locate them and build them, and then be able to move on with her life.

Pay equity put one YWCA in a Catch-22 situation during both the Harris and McGuinty eras. This YWCA supported the goals of pay equity for women to be paid equally to men. Government legislation required the YWCA to have a pay equity plan in place and to make annual increases in salaries to achieve pay equity, but it did not provide the additional funding needed to achieve these goals. As a result, pay equity increases were made by the YWCA but at the expense of agency services and reserves. The Executive Director of this YWCA described this issue:

It was one of those situations that was just unbelievable that we could be caught in this Catch 22 ...And so I started writing letters and letters... I wrote interminable letters. I wrote to the Harris government people and then as soon as McGuinty came in I started writing to him, saying, "it used to be their policy but now its yours, so now what are you doing to do about it because you are now the one that's doing this to us and are you aware that you are going to drive this organization into bankruptcy?"

That was a very, very difficult lobby because I came to understand that no government was going to truly embrace it because they understood that we were so underpaid that it was going to be a crippling cost. But what the McGuinty government did was to start to give increases that at least covered those pay equity obligations, so that therefore there was some relief...It's like you're killing us with this program that we think is truly important - so that was very difficult.

Substantiated by interviews with an Executive Director and a staff member, further change embedded in relations of ruling between the government and the YWCAs was a requirement that the Executive Director of one of the YWCAs advise the Ministry of her schedule from 8:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m. every day so that she was available to respond at any time to a questions posed by or to the Minister. This requirement reinforced the notion of the NGOs as a shadow state and the image of the strings between the NGO and the state being both shortened and tightened.

#### Dangers for Women: Increased Use of Gender-Neutral Language

While violence against women has a long history, it has often been hidden from public view, cloaked in a "veil of words" obscuring the violence and the patriarchal power relations involved (Duffy and Momirov, 1997, p. 10, 13). Jane Jenson (2008) suggested that there is "a need to worry" (p. 38) about the dangers created for women by the policies of new-neoliberal or social investment states. Through their focus on children and on future results, new-neoliberal states pay less attention to the here and now and to the immediate needs of women and their families. As these social investment states "are at work: (1) folding gender in and (2) writing women out" (Jenson, 2008, p. 138), they obscure the visibility of the inequalities faced by women.

Neoliberal and new-neoliberal governments favour anti-feminist and gender-neutral discourses and approaches to violence against women work; they favour terms which render women and the systemic issues that lead to violence against them invisible (Collier, 2008, 2009, 2010). The current study examined the use of feminist and gender-neutral terms in the annual reports of the three YWCAs. Feminist language includes terms such as "violence against women," "women's equality," "feminist," "feminism," and "structural inequality," while gender-neutral language refers to "domestic violence," "family violence," "wife assault or abuse," "law and order issues" and passive descriptions such as "women are beaten" (Collier, 2010, p. 9).

This research revealed differences in the use of this language by each of the YWCAs and found a significant shift when comparing the use of language during the terms of the two governments. Based on this examination of YWCA annual reports, it was found that during the Harris era, feminist terminology was used in two-thirds (66.7%) of all references to violence-against-women work by the YWCAs studied. This was almost reversed during the McGuinty years, as the use of gender-neutral language grew to almost two-thirds (60.9%) of the total references to violence-against-women work. This finding suggests that the YWCAs shifted their use of language to better match the dominant language used by the government. While this may have benefited them in their funding and relationships with the state, it raises questions about the dangers this creates for women as language which obscures systemic issues is adopted by those working in the violence-against-women sector.

#### Dangers for Women: Continuing Poverty

Even with the increased openness of the McGuinty government, a key tension that did not change with them was their failure to address the poverty that women faced. This government opened communications with the shelters and increased some funding but they did not address the levels of poverty brought about by the Harris government. One of the Executive Directors commented that this had a major impact on women served:

Certainly the McGuinty government tried to do some catch-up as far as ... their funding for VAW shelters. But, I just really think...to go back to the welfare rates, really, the impact upon the women that we work with was the most pronounced.

The observation that poverty continued for women relates to the aforementioned comment by an activist which noted that "Harris lingers on." Effects of the Harris government lingered on for the women served by the YWCAs as they struggled with ongoing issues related to poverty. They continued in the strain on community resources. Even as McGuinty restored some funding to the YWCAs, the poverty of the women served and the limitations affecting other community resources, such as housing, legal aid and child care, continued. This had devastating consequence for the women served. It also placed enormous pressures on the YWCAs and other organizations serving women. An activist claimed this to be the "biggest disappointment" with the McGuinty government:

I think probably, I'll speak only for myself here, but I suspect others would agree, the biggest disappointment [with the McGuinty government] was the lack of attention to women's poverty. So you know, no real welfare reform, I think the cuts under Harris were something like 35% and I think really we haven't seen anything significant to come back from that.

One of the activists noted that there had not yet been a return to pre-Harris days. This participant stated:

One of the biggest damages of a real right wing reactive government, is that you never get back to where you were which was not good enough to begin with, but you start to think of what you had before as being really great and different from what it is. So it's almost like we all lower our standards and expectations. If the McGuinty government had preceded the Harris government, we wouldn't have thought it was a really great government.

To this person, the effects of Harris lingered on, not only directly, but also in changes made as expectations and the vision of what was needed were lowered.

To one staff member, the failure of the McGuinty government to address poverty and its impact on women created pressures for the YWCA to "become everything" to the women they served:

What we're finding is that what women expect from us, it's just increased tenfold. So you know, we've become, it's just like everything...what's happening, women are waiting longer and longer for housing...most of our women have been here almost a year... the expectations on us are huge.

While at the YWCAs, women who had experienced violence found refuge not only through shelter from violence for themselves and their children, but also through the availability of food, laundry facilities, transportation and other resources and supports. There was a significant contrast for women between living in poverty and living in a YWCA shelter, a place where a staff member commented they "never run out of milk." This produced huge expectations and pressures on the YWCAs. A staff member explained:

We try to have really good food, we have lots of donations, you know, the house is clean, there's always food in the fridge, *we never run out of milk*, and yet when women go out there ...sometimes, their only choice for a better life is to deal with, to be involved with another man who is abusive. So, what are we really doing to in terms of breaking that cycle, right? And if women could get out there and have a decent wage, and have housing that's affordable, it's just creating, it's creating [a] huge vortex of what our expectations are, we get women calling us all the time, you know, we have a little food bank downstairs, women still need food, so it's, *the expectations on us are huge*.

A staff member noted that their YWCA felt the pressure from "becoming... like everything" to their clients. This participant stated that due to the combined effects of ongoing poverty among the women served by the YWCAs, the modest increases in the YWCA's funding, and reduced services due to the continued funding challenges faced by other community organizations, their YWCA faced *tenfold* increases in expectations from the women they served.

#### Conclusions

According to an interviewed activist, the McGuinty government's failure to address poverty for women demonstrates how neoliberalism lingered on under its administration. It lingered on for the women served by the YWCAs as they struggled with ongoing issues related to poverty, violence, and with the lack of support for housing, child care and legal services. It lingered further for the YWCAs as they faced ongoing funding restraints. The YWCAs were in the difficult position of serving women whose needs were greater at the same time as their access to resources were reduced.

The YWCAs felt pressure to act as *lifeboats* and to *become everything* to the women they served due to reduced and altered funding, short-term contracts, new accountability expectations, gender-neutral language, the need to rescue and save women, and increasing poverty among the women served by their violence-against-women programs. These expectations increased the importance of connections with the state; they also brought greater dangers for women. Clients at the YWCA shelters stayed longer than before, as access to second stage and transitional housing were also reduced. Staff at the YWCAs worked harder "to do more, multi-task more" so that "service delivery did not get worse" in the face of reduced funding (staff focus group). The YWCAs became *lifeboats* to their clients, a role that created risks to the YWCAs and the women who worked there while also being a valuable form of resistance.

**About the Author:** Casey Ready, Ph.D. (TRENT UNIVERSITY), M.S.W. (UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO), B.S.W. (UNIVERSITY OF WESTERN ONTARIO). Casey successfully defended her doctoral thesis in September 2012. She has experience in social research, policy development, community engagement and service delivery related to social and community services offered by government and the non-profit sector, including as Executive Director of three NGOs. Her research interests include gender issues in the social welfare state, the relationship of the non-profit sector to the social welfare state, violence against women, women and poverty, community engagement and social justice. Email: catherineready@trentu.ca or casey.ready@utoronto.ca.

#### References

- Arai, S.M., Reid, D. G. (2003). Impacts of a neo-liberal policy shift on citizenship and the voluntary sector: A policy delphi with social planning organizations. *Canadian Review of Social Policy*, 52, 67-92.
- Bashevkin, S. (2002). *Welfare hot buttons: Women, work and social policy reform*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Bezanson, K. (2006). *Gender, the State and Social Reproduction: Household Insecurity in Neo-Liberal Times*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Bonisteel, M., Green, L. (2005). *Implications for the shrinking space for feminist anti-violence advocacy*. Fredricton, New Brunswick: Presented at the 2005 Canadian Social Welfare Policy Conference.
- Braedley, S., Luxton, M., (Eds). (2010). *Neoliberalism and Everyday Life*. Montreal and Kingston, London, Ithaca: McGill-Queen's University Press.
- Brock, K. (2001). Democracy is coming: The new interest in NGOs, civil society, and the third sector, *The Philanthropist, 16* (4), 263-271.

- Canadian Centre for Philanthropy. (2003). *The Capacity to Serve: A Qualitative Study of the Challenges CanadCCFacing Canada's Nonprofit and Voluntary Organizations*. Toronto: Canadian Centre for Philanthropy.
- Chunn, D. E., Gavigan, S. (2004). Welfare law, welfare fraud and the moral regulation of the never deserving poor. *Social and Legal Studies, 13* (2), 219-243.
- Cohen, M. G. (1997). From the welfare state to vampire capitalism. In P. Evens, G. Wekerle, (Eds). *Women and the Canadian welfare state* (pp. 28 -70). Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Collier, C. N. (2008). Neoliberalism and violence against women: Can retrenchment convergence explain the path of a provincial anti-violence policy, 1985-2005? *Canadian Journal of Political Science*, *41*(1), 19-42.
- Collier, C. N. (2009). Violence against women or violence against "people"? Assessing the impact of neoliberalism and "post-neoliberalism" and anti-violence policy in Ontario and British Columbia. In A. Dobrowolsky, (Ed). *Women and public policy in Canada. Neoliberalism and after?* (pp. 199-186). Toronto: Oxford University Press.
- Collier, C. N. (June 2010). *The disappearing woman? Locating gender equality in contemporary child care and anti-violence policy debates in Canada*. Unpublished manuscript.
- Cossman, B. (2002). Family Feuds: Neo-Liberal and Neo-Conservative Visions of the Reprivatization Project. In J. Fudge, B. Cossman (Eds). *Privatization, Law and the Challenge to Feminism* (pp. 169-217). Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Cossman, B., Fudge, J., (2002). *Privatization, Law and the Challenge to Feminism*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Dobrowolsky, A., (2009). Introduction: Neoliberalism and after? In A. Dobrowolsky (Ed). *Women and Public Policy in Canada. Neoliberalism and After*? (pp. 1-24). Toronto: Oxford University Press.
- Dobrowolsky, A. (Autumn 2002). Rhetoric versus reality: The figure of the child and new labour's strategic 'social investment state'. *Studies in Political Economy*, 69, 43-73.
- Duffy, A., Momirov, J., Family Violence: A Canadian Introduction. James Lorimer & Company, 1997.
- Eakin, L. (2004). *Community capacity draining: The impacts of current funding practices on non-profit community organizations*. Toronto: Community Social Planning Council of Toronto.
- Eakin, L. (2007). We can't afford to do business this way: A study of the administrative burder resulting from funder accountability and compliance practices. Toronto: Wellesley Institute.
- Hackworth, J. (Spring 2008). The durability of roll-out neoliberalism under centre-left governance: The case of Ontario's social housing sector. *Studies in Political Economy*, *81*, 7-26.
- Harstock, N. (1996). Postmodernism and political change: Issues for feminist theory. In S. Hekman (Ed). *Feminist interpretations of Foucault* (pp. 39-58). University Park, P. A.: Pennsylvania University Press.
- Harvey, D. (2005). A Brief History of Neoliberalism. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Hesse-Biber, S.N., Leavey, P.L., (Eds). (2007). *Feminist research practice: A primer*. Thousand Oaks, London and New Delhi: Sage Publications.
- Little, M. (2003). The leaner, meaner welfare machine: The Ontario conservative government's ideological and material attack on single mothers. In D. Brock (Ed.), *Making normal* (pp. 235-258). Toronto: Nelson Canada.
- Miller, C. (1998). Canadian non-profits in crisis: The need for reform. *Social Policy and Administration*, 32(4), 401-419.
- Milligan, C., Conradson, D. (2006). *Landscapes of voluntarism: New spaces for health, welfare and governance*. Bristol, U.K.: The Policy Press, University of Bristol.
- Naples, N. A. (2003). *Feminism and method: Ethnography, discourse analysis and activist research*. New York: Routledge.
- Offe, C. (1984). J. Keane (Ed). Contradictions of the welfare state. London: Hutchinson.
- Ontario Association of Interval and Transition Houses (OAITH). (November 1996). Locked in left out: Impacts of the progressive conservative budget cuts and policy initiatives on abused women and their children in Ontario. Toronto.

- Ontario Association of Interval and Transition Houses (OAITH). (November 1998). *Falling through the gender gap: How Ontario government policy continues to fail abused women and their children*. Toronto: Ontario Women's Justice Network.
- Panitch, L. (1977). *The Canadian state: Political economy and political power*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Rose, N., O'Malley, P., Valverde, M. (2006). Governmentality. Annual Review Law Society, 2, 83-104.
- Scott, K. (2003). Funding Matters: The Impact of Canada's New Funding Regime on Nonprofit and Voluntary Organizations. Canadian Council on Social Development.
- Smith, D. E. (2005). Institutional ethnography: A sociology for people. Oxford: AltaMira Press.
- Struthers, J. (1994). *The limits of affluence: Welfare in Ontario, 1920-1970*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Wolch, J. (1990). *The shadow state: Government and voluntary sector in transition*. New York: The Foundation Centre.

## Appendix 1

Questions for Interviews

## An Uneasy Alliance: Negotiating Feminism in "New-Neoliberal" Times

- 1. How long have you been involved with the YWCA?
- 2. Can you describe what the YWCA does in relation to violence against women (VAW)?
- 3. In what ways have you been involved with the VAW work of the YWCA?
- 4. How does your YWCA define its work with women?
- 5. In this study, feminism is defined broadly as representing "a movement to end sexist oppression" (bell hooks).
  - a. Does your YWCA identify its work as having a feminist agenda, and if so, what does this mean?
  - b. Are there ways that the YWCA does its work that you would not define as feminist?
- 6. I am interested in understanding how policies of the Ontario government have affected the Violence Against Women (VAW) work of the YWCA.
  - a. What policies and funding approaches did your VAW services experience in the Harris era (1995-2002)
  - b. Did these approaches change when the McGuinty government came to power in 2003? If yes, how?
  - c. How has your YWCA responded to the policies of the Harris government?
  - d. How did they respond to the first term of the McGuinty government?
  - e. Which aspects of your VAW services have been most affected by the policies of the Harris and McGuinty governments, and how have they been affected?
- 7. What strategies and initiatives has your YWCA employed in response to government changes?
- 8. In what ways has your YWCA maintained your VAW services? Have they increased, decreased or changed under these governments?
- 9. Has your philosophy related to VAW service changed in response to the changes of these governments?
- 10. Have spaces been found for rethinking and revising the YWCA's VAW services in response to changes in government funding?
  - a. If yes, what are these changes?
  - b. In what ways do you feel they are consistent with feminist frameworks?

September 17, 2010

*CGJSC / RCESSC* Vol. 1, Iss/Num. 1, Summer/Été 2012

## Appendix 2

Questions for Focus Groups

## Research Study on How Different Governments Affect Violence Against Women Services

- 1. Can you describe what your YWCA does in relation to violence against women?
- 2. In this study, feminism is defined broadly as representing "a movement to end sexist oppression" (bell hooks).
  - a. Does your YWCA identify its work as having a feminist agenda, and if so, what does this mean?
  - b. Are there ways that the YWCA does its work that you would not define as feminist?
- 3. I am interested in understanding how policies of different Ontario governments have affected the VAW work of the YWCA.
  - a. What policies and funding approaches did your VAW services experience in the Harris era (1995-2002)?
  - b. Did these approaches change when the McGuinty government came to power in 2003? If yes, how?
- 4. What strategies and initiatives has your YWCA employed in response to government changes?
- 5. In what ways has your YWCA maintained its VAW services?
- 6. Have spaces been found for rethinking and revising the YWCA's VAW services in response to changes in government funding?
  - a. If yes, what are these changes?
  - b. In what ways do you feel they are consistent with feminist frameworks?

September 17, 2010

## Appendix 3

Questions for Interviews – External Contacts

An Uneasy Alliance: Negotiating Feminism in "New-Neoliberal" Times Student Investigator: Catherine (Casey) Ready, Ph.D. Candidate Student Faculty Supervisor: Dr. James Struthers

- 1. How long have you been involved with the VAW work?
- 2. Can you describe what the YWCA does in relation to violence against women (VAW)?
- 3. In what ways have you been involved with the VAW work of the YWCA?
- 4. In this study, feminism is defined broadly as representing "a movement to end sexist oppression" (bell hooks).
  - a. Would you identify the YWCA as having a feminist agenda, and if so, what does this mean?
  - b. Are there ways that the YWCA does its work that you would not define as feminist?
- 5. I am interested in understanding how policies of the Ontario government have affected the Violence Against Women (VAW) work of the YWCA.
  - a. What policies and funding approaches did VAW services experience in the Harris era (1995-2002)
  - b. Did these approaches change when the McGuinty government came to power in 2003? If yes, how?
  - c. In your view, how has the YWCA responded to the policies of the Harris government?
  - d. How did they respond to the first term of the McGuinty government?
  - e. Which aspects of the YWCA VAW services have been most affected by the policies of the Harris and McGuinty governments, and how have they been affected?
- 6. What strategies and initiatives has the YWCA employed in response to government changes?
- 7. In what ways has the YWCA maintained its VAW services? Have they increased, decreased or changed under these governments?
- 8. Has the YWCA philosophy related to VAW service changed in response to the changes of these governments?
- 9. Have spaces been found for rethinking and revising the YWCA's VAW services in response to changes in government funding?
  - a. If yes, what are these changes?
  - b. In what ways do you feel they are consistent with feminist frameworks?

September 17, 2010 Revised November 30, 2010 for External Interviews



## An Arranged Marriage: Police – Media Conflict & Collaboration

## Robert Chrismas University of Manitoba, Mauro Centre for Peace and Justice

Media and police professionals are bound together in interdependent, and often tense, working relationships. For different purposes both professions need to work effectively together while simultaneously retaining independence from each other. These complex inter-reliant relationships create unique challenges that often call for improvement. This essay examines whether relationships between interdependent professional organizations can be improved through a collaborative problem-solving intervention, based on the interactive methods of facilitated dialogue and appreciative inquiry. The article describes a case study of a large Canadian police agency working with local media outlets to improve their working relationship. It highlights the importance of conflict analysis followed by effective change management strategies in implementation of collaborative solutions that meet everyone's needs. This case study illustrates dynamics that generalize to organizations that have strong organizational cultures and are highly independent and simultaneously required to work together. Some examples of such organizations are military, prison guards, scholars, medical professionals, social workers, teachers, lawyers and most government agencies.

#### Keywords: Facilitated dialogue; Collaboration; Organizational culture; Change management

Les médias et les corps policiers sont à la fois interreliés et interdépendants, et leur collaboration est souvent tendue. Dans divers objectifs, ils doivent travailler efficacement ensemble tout en maintenant leur propre autonomie. Ces relations complexes donnent lieu à des difficultés auxquelles il faut remédier. Cet essai porte sur les améliorations pouvant être apportées dans les relations entre deux organisations professionnelles interdépendants par l'entremise d'une intervention visant à résoudre les problèmes fondée sur des méthodes interactives de facilitation du dialogue et d'interrogation appréciative. Cet article décrit un cas où une grande agence policière canadienne a collaboré avec des médias locaux en vue d'améliorer leur relation de travail. On y souligne l'importance de l'analyse des conflits suivie de stratégies efficaces de gestion du changement dans la mise en œuvre de solutions axées sur la collaboration et répondant aux besoins de tous. Cette étude présente les dynamiques communes aux organismes indépendants dont la culture d'entreprise est bien affirmée, et devant travailler en partenariat. Parmi ces organisations, on compte l'armée, les gardes de prison, le secteur universitaire, le corps médical, les travailleurs sociaux, les enseignants, les avocats et la plupart des organismes gouvernementaux.

Mots-clés : facilitation du dialogue; collaboration; culture d'entreprise; gestion du changement

## Introduction

Recent decades have seen ever-increasing public access to information, resulting in higher accountability in the policing profession. Law enforcement agencies have felt greater need for effective messaging to demonstrate transparency and to satisfy the public appetite for immediate, accurate information about crime, justice and community issues. Reporters and news outlets are under constant pressure to produce stories in a demanding and competitive environment. Internet based news casts often require hourly updates on top of traditionally demanding publishing deadlines, all intensifying pressures on reporters. As a result, the interdependent police-media relationship is often strained. This paper examines how police-media tensions may be reduced for more effective working relationships. It is not presented as a report on a comprehensive research project. Rather, it offers insights into the dynamics of interdependent working relationships, and highlights opportunities for properly designed and controlled future studies. As an active police officer, I offer a practitioner's perspective. I am a senior ranking officer in a Canadian police agency with 1,500 officers, and have given interviews and worked with numerous reporters in print, radio and film media on policing related issues. I have also taught aspects of media relations to police officers in training to be public information officers for their policing agencies. In order to protect their identities, the police organization examined for this case study is referred to as "A Police Agency" (APS), and individuals will be referred to generically as police officers or reporters. The term "media" will refer to the broad spectrum of news outlets including television, radio and print formats.

A literature review provides context and highlights elements of police-media roles and relationships. It describes theories that support analysis of this conflicted relationship, as well as ways to reconcile and move forward. A facilitated dialogue exercise conducted between APS and local media outlets is described as a case study to highlight dynamics that generalize to other scenarios wherein independent agencies must work together. The findings highlight the complexity of working relationships, and that conflict resolution is more an ongoing continuous process than a singular event. This exercise underlines the importance of conflict analysis, effective resolution processes, and attention to how solutions are carried out. Failure to attend to any of these three key areas likely results in failure to improve collaboration and mutual needs attainment.

#### **Police-Media Relations**

Some authors have described the relationship between policing and the media as symbiotic (Boyle, 1999; Guffy, 1992), in that both professions are highly independent, mutually supportive and also competitive. Police need media for outreach to the public while they are simultaneously cautious of the intense scrutiny that the media is often perceived to fuel. Media are challenged to balance public accountability, reporting on alleged police infractions, while maintaining working relationships with the very officers they need to illicit information from. Cooke and Sturges (2008) characterized police-media relationships as complex loops of interdependence. Police need media for critical information releases and also must keep certain details secret. Reporters are bound to work with the police in order to gather information that is critical for substantial portions of the daily news (Becker, 1967). During major events, reporters and police officers must work together to release important information to the public (Bellew, Caeti, & Liederbach, 2004).

Police need media for public appeals and as the main channel for public legitimization and transparency. At the same time, they must maintain a level of secrecy, to preserve the integrity of ongoing investigations and to protect the dignity and privacy of victims and the public that they serve (Guffy, 1992). They must withhold information from the media, while simultaneously asking for their assistance. Reporters seek to establish trusting relationships with police sources while simultaneously remaining at arms length, in order to preserve journalistic objectivity and independence on issues such as alleged police corruption or misconduct. In some cases, reporting on alleged police misconduct creates tension in the relationships that reporters are simultaneously striving to develop (Surrette, 1989).

Selki and Bartoszek (1984) found that both police officers and reporters are indoctrinated early in their careers through formal training, mentoring, and experience, with cynicism and distrust over their respective intentions and roles. Having worked in law enforcement for over 28 years, I can attest that Selki and Bartoszek's findings remain apposite today. In this age of instant access to information through the Internet, in which police officers are routinely recorded and confronted regarding actions they have taken in their work, they are arguably even more cautious of the media.

News stories about work related issues often personally impact police officers' personal relationships with friends and family, and can adversely impact their careers. Reporters, on the other hand, can feel frustration over being stonewalled by the police regarding details of high public-interest

cases. Issues that are of highest interest to the media and the public are often the most sensitive to police, and require the highest secrecy and control of information that can be released.

It is also important to note that neither media nor police are homogeneous groups. Internal conflict occurs as reporters are in competition with each other, continually seeking inside information in order to beat their competitors with leading stories (confidential sources). This competition creates tension within law enforcement agencies as many reporters continually seek confidential police sources to circumvent formal information channels. This dynamic also creates tension for police officers who are often encouraged to be open and forthcoming with the media while, at the same time, they are closely regulated over information that can be released. Senior police officials have diverse opinions about how police officers should interact with media. Some support open transparency between all police officers and media, while others feel only public affairs personnel or senior officers, and not others, should be the conduits of information to the press. Both approaches have merit, however they both must include controls, as inappropriate or untimely release of information can undermine ongoing investigations, breach privacy laws, or place officers and the public in danger.

All of these contradictory needs and mandates inevitably create tension within and between media outlets and police agencies. The dynamics make police-media relationships challenging, yet they are bound to work together. For these reasons Sir Robert Mark, Commissioner of the British Metropolitan Police from 1972 to 1977, characterized the police-media relationship as "an enduring if not ecstatically happy marriage" (Cooke and Sturges, 2008).

#### A Case Study: APS and Media

APS's relationship with local media outlets can generally be characterized as consistent with Sir Robert Mark's description (Cooke and Sturges, 2008); it resembles an arranged marriage with a long history of occasional domestic disputes. For the most part, however, the relationship has been productive, particularly in recent years wherein the APS Chief and executive have made transparency and public accountability a priority. Consistent with worldwide policing trends the APS has a dedicated Public Information Office (PIO), which coordinates the outflow of information to the media on significant or newsworthy events (Boyle, 1999). While information is released through other means, such as monthly crime statistics on the APS website and annual reports, significant events occur daily, requiring APS members to answer reporters' questions. Ongoing experience has taught police agencies that being proactive and putting appropriate information out early can prevent inaccurate or negative stories from developing. Executive members in APS's Chief's office approve messages and the PIO conducts daily briefings on significant events. The PIO maintains relationships with key members of the journalistic community, ensuring the APS is enabled with mechanisms for controlled public messaging and some ability for damage control when it is required. On occasion, reporters have discovered sensitive information that could compromise ongoing investigations and operations, in some cases endangering the safety of police officers and citizens if it was released too early to the public. For instance, on occasion reporters learn of search warrants that are being prepared. If news of a search warrant is released, suspects can destroy evidence, flee, or even lay in wait to attack police officers when they execute the warrant. PIOs, or any officer for that matter, with good working relationships with reporters can negotiate the necessary delay in reporting, in exchange for favors such as an exclusive story at a later time. As a major case coordinator I have had first-hand experience and can say this ability to negotiate is critical.

From 7:00 AM to 5:00 PM, seven days a week, APS PIO staff are available for media inquiries, and they conduct a briefing on major events at 11:00 AM most days. On days when a briefing is not held, media releases on major events are sent out by mass e-mail. Major events that involve the police, and are of interest to the media, however, happen 24 hours a day. To fill the void after-hours, the duty office acts as the official spokesperson for the Police Service. A senior ranking officer, overseeing frontline operations of APS, staffs the duty office at all times, around the clock. Benchmarking with two other police agencies that are similar in size to APS, it was learned that all agencies have different communication strategies. One agency has a PIO office that runs Monday to Friday 8:30 AM to 4:30 PM,

and they have no coverage on weekends. Another agency has a senior officer that works as a street supervisor 24/7, and that officer addresses the media as required when the PIO is closed. All agencies examined have different relationships with the media, therefore the question about reporting mechanisms may be less relevant than having a process for improving working relationships, which this paper seeks to reveal.

The APS duty officer is the designated official spokesperson to the media when the PIO is off duty. The duty officer often becomes so busy dealing with real-time operational command issues, that he or she may find calls from the media distracting and disruptive. Consequently, reporters have been restricted to calling a dedicated phone line in the duty office between 5:00 AM to 7:00 AM, and 10:00 PM to midnight, and at no other time. If the duty officer is not busy with urgent business, they will answer the dedicated media line during the specified hours. Outside of those hours duty officers do not answer that line.

As a duty officer myself, I routinely interacted with other duty officers and reporters. Concerns were being expressed on both sides about the effectiveness of the working relationship. Duty officers reported it was annoying when reporters called every day, asking vague questions such as "anything to report?" Some duty officers view asking non-specific questions, known as "fishing," as laziness by reporters. Officers have often stated that reporters should do their own preliminary work on stories and then call with specific questions, as it is not the role of the police to create stories for media. Duty officers were finding that reporters often appear to not understand the duty officer's role, asking officers for information that is impossible or inappropriate for them to release. For example, asking about events that happened the previous day is considered inappropriate because detectives are already assigned and the duty officer rarely has sufficient up-to-date knowledge to comment appropriately.

Reporters expressed frustration at inconsistent levels of cooperation from different duty officers. For instance, some provided sound bites while others would not. Some officers were more willing than others to make inquiries, look up police reports, or even call officers at the scene of a major event for updates that would assist reporters in preparing their stories. Reporters also claimed that the duty office hours of availability made it difficult for them to meet broadcast and print deadlines. Reporters have complained that there is obvious inconsistency between the individual duty officers and will even alter their approaches depending on who is working in the duty office on particular shifts. Some reporters have attempted to circumvent police public information processes. For instance in some cases reporters' associates from other provinces have called the duty officer, and then denying knowledge about the time periods in which they were supposed to call. On some occasions reporters have recorded conversations as a sound bite, without the duty officer's consent. These small infractions tend to damage relationships between all of the stakeholders and propagate a milieu of distrust.

The conflict described above is rooted partially in the way that the APS PIO function is structured. Answering media inquiries is an add-on responsibility for duty officers who operate in realtime and often demanding command roles. Personalities are a significant factor as different duty officers have varying levels of comfort, experience, and training in conducting media interviews. Some are more receptive to speaking with the media than others. Some have had bad personal experiences as a result of news reports. Reporters all have different levels of experience and different needs as well. Experienced reporters tend to have a better understanding of the importance of establishing relationships with people who they intend to later ask for information. These dynamics are somewhat unique as they relate to police-media relations; however, there are also aspects and dynamics that can be understood through existing research and literature on general conflict analysis and resolution. The following review highlights some applicable theories and existing literature.

#### **Literature Review**

Druckman's situational model locates the source of every conflict on a spectrum between individual characteristics of the participants and social systems (Cheldelin, Druckman, & Fast, 2003). The model

suites analysis of police-media tensions as both groups are comprised of professionals with strong individual characteristics. Both professions have powerful ethos that tend to propagate strongly defined organizational cultures.

Zwell (2000) described organizational culture as comprising language, beliefs, shared knowledge and characteristics that bind groups so they can work well together. Both policing and journalism are clearly defined professional cultures, steeped in values, norms, and a strong sense of group affiliation by their members. Both professions also have shared goals and values that may serve as a starting point for reconciliation. While the media are profit-oriented commercial businesses, for the most part, they provide services that resemble the police mandate to act in the public interest. Therefore, goals serving the public good are a shared value upon which conflict solutions could be based. Understanding their respective cultures facilitates analyzing police-media conflict and identifying potential resolution strategies.

Police agencies have unique organizational cultures (Crank, 1998; Niederhoffer, 1967; Paoline, 2000; Prenzler, 1997; Skolnick, 1994; Van Maanen, 1974, 1978; Westley, 1970). Nickels and Verma (2008) noted themes that mold police culture commonly include: danger and ambiguity, authority to use force, discretion, estrangement from civilians, bureaucracy, shift-work, routine contact with criminals, antagonism between front-line officers and managers, and occasionally vague and conflicting mandates.

Journalism has equally distinct language and core values (Deuze, 2005). Research has confirmed that objectivity and impartiality are values that permeate journalism throughout the world (Hanitzsch, 2005; Herscovitz, 2004; Ramaprasad, 2001; Weaver et al., 2007; Weaver, 1998). Splichal and Sparks (1994) surveyed first-year journalism students in 22 countries and found consistent similarity in their stated desire for independence and autonomy.

Elements in police and journalism cultures can create barriers to communication, as members of both groups inevitably tend to view the world as us vs. others. But the two professions are not to be confused as being the same; as pointed out several times throughout this paper, they are quite different. The police generally report to inform on issues that impact public safety, and to provide the public a sense of closure on major issues, generally keeping their opinions about political aspects to a minimum.

Media report on a much broader spectrum of issues and delve into them in more depth. Reporters can challenge political aspects of issues that the police, as politically neutral public servants, strive to avoid (Scheufele, 1999). News reports can drive political agendas by focusing on specific issues and framing stories in certain ways (McCombs, 1972). Reporters seeking information or confirming facts for stories that the police have no interest in, or which show the police in a poor light, can cause domestic tensions to rise. When the focus is on public safety, however, we find common ground that serves police interests and makes news stories of high public interest. The distinguishing cultural elements of policing and journalism can be useful for predicting behaviour, identifying where tensions may develop or already exist, finding common goals, and solving conflicts.

While policing and journalism are defined professions, they are comprised of individuals, each with their own personal characteristics. Police and news agencies are made up of individuals from diverse backgrounds, experiences, educations and attitudes. Cheldelin, Druckman and Fast (2003) have underlined how distinct professions are also internally divided. Individual police officers and reporters identify with their respective professions while they are frequently polarized and conflicted within their organizations. I have known reporters who disagree with their editors on the focus of stories published, and who disagree with the approaches other reporters take on stories. Similarly in policing, many if not most police officers disagree with at least some laws or policies they are required to enforce, and disagree with the attitudes and methods of some colleagues. Police officers come from all walks of life. They learn to work within a common framework and value system in order to function within their agencies. However, officers also have their own individual idiosyncrasies and beliefs that are shaped by unique backgrounds, experiences and education.

Sandole (2009) accurately describes the dynamics of police-media relations through the range of conflict resolution types (cited in Cheldelin, Druckman, & Fast, 2003, p. 49). Sandole described approach-approach scenarios, in which both parties want to resolve issues, as the optimum opportunity for collaboration. In approach-avoidance scenarios one side wants change, while the other wants to avoid the

conflict (cited in Cheldelin, Druckman, & Fast, 2003, p. 49). The police-media relationship appears to be an approach-avoidance scenario as reporters generally wanted change and the police generally were seeking to avoid the issue. This is explored more in-depth later in the paper.

Simmel (1955) summarized five potential general patterns of conflict resolution: (1) disappearance of the object of the conflict, (2) victory for one party, (3) compromise, (4) conciliation, and (5) irreconcilability (cited in Schellenberg, 1996, p. 66). While dated, Simmel's theory has withstood the test of time and appears highly relevant here. Within the framework of Simmel's model, this case study describes the transformation of police-media conflict by reducing structural barriers, and achieving shared solutions through conciliation. The goal was not victory for one party over the other, or compromise, but, rather, the creation of win-win solutions through collaboration.

Analysis of this conflict also begs the question; how should potential solutions be implemented? Scholars have found that the biggest reason for the failure of organizational change is that not enough thought has been applied to their impacts on people (Bridges, 2003).

Administrators must recognize external factors that they have little or no control over, and the psychological effect that change can have on people (Cameron, & Green, 2004). Lewin (1947) was a pioneer in managing organizational change, focusing on the human aspects that can cause initiatives to fail. He suggested that leaders must prepare people psychologically to understand the need for change (the "unfreezing" stage). In the anchoring stage ("refreezing"), the changes that have been made are internalized and accepted (Lewin, 1947). Awareness of these human resource dynamics and effective change management skills can enhance the success of changes that flow from effective conciliation.

Yet another aspect to consider is who runs the process of change. Sampson (2003) studied peace building in conflicted societies, describing the risk of community members being seen as traitors to the local group when they return from peace building summits. In this scenario, police officers and media managers attending meetings could be seen as not representing all members of their respective groups. As described earlier, both the police and media have strong organizational cultures, but neither are homogenous groups.

This paper explores whether improved collaboration and communication between two interdependent organizations, with intergroup tensions, results from a conciliation strategy, based on effective analysis of the structural/situational issues, collaborative problem solving, and effective change management. The objective is to improve police-media relationships for increased effectiveness in both groups. The broader goal is to understand dynamics of collaboration that generalize to diverse agencies that must work together interdependently.

#### **The Collaboration**

A meeting was arranged between media managers and APS duty officers to seek collaborative solutions to problems that were identified in conversations with members of both groups. My observations are based on informal discussions with fellow duty officers, past and present, and reporters from print, radio, and televised news agencies that deal with the APS duty office after hours. Full-time PIO officers, past and present, were also interviewed in this brief, informal assessment of people's attitudes, impressions, and opinions, as well as their perceptions of structural challenges that were exacerbating police-media tensions. These discussions happened in the normal course of my work as a duty officer, and I later recognized the situation as an opportunity for improved working relationships between the police and media. No university ethics approval was sought as this exercise was conducted entirely within the context of a business meeting between the police and the media, and all involved were fully aware that any results would be recorded, reported and acted upon.

PIO staff members were included because they deal face-to-face with the media on a daily basis and they are an integral part of the existing APS public relations structure. The existing conflicts appeared to involve attitude, experience and structural constraints mirroring the competing needs of the police and media agencies. Dr. Sean Byrne of the University of Manitoba Arthur V. Mauro Centre for Peace and Justice was consulted on how to best run a solution-seeking meeting between these two groups (2010). He suggested separating the stakeholders into mixed groups and challenging them to identify problems that could be addressed. He further suggested that the groups could then be challenged to identify potential solutions that could then be discussed and prioritized by the entire group. In this way, police and media stakeholders could develop shared solutions, and both would feel ownership in the resulting changes (Byrne, 2010).

In this day and age, it is extremely difficult to get busy professionals into a meeting for a full day. Therefore, I arranged a half-day meeting with as many duty officers and media representatives as possible. The PIO office provided a list of senior managers from local media outlets that could best speak to how their news staff interacts with the APS duty office. The initial invitation that was sent out emphasized collaboration and shared solutions, setting the tone for the planned meeting. All three APS PIO staff members attended, along with six media representatives and five police commanders who work fulltime in the duty office. Unfortunately, the other four duty officers could not attend. Six senior journalist-managers represented the media from print, radio, and televised news agencies. Exercises were designed to create consensus, identifying problems and then developing collaborative solutions. The anticipated outcome was that consensuses would emerge on some shared solutions. The optimistic long-term goal was to reach a 'tipping point' at which the police and media would become less adversarial and become more team oriented, despite their differing mandates (Gladwell, 2002).

The challenges perceived by the participants needed to be reframed from an adversarial to a collaborative approach, moving parties from an approach-avoidance to an approach-approach dynamic (Sandole, 2009). Moving parties in both groups to collaborate would be more conducive to removing structural barriers to working together (Simmel, 1955). Most of the media and police stakeholders perceived structural barriers around the times that media are allowed to call the duty office. The participating media stakeholders all expressed willingness to work together for improved processes; the police were more mixed in their receptiveness to the idea. Hence, my assessment of this relationship was an approach-avoidance scenario within Sandole's model (2009). The media were generally seeking change and the duty officers were somewhat willing to collaborate, although some were not interested in working with the media. Therefore, I predicted varying degrees of success with participating duty officers, and greater success among the media representatives. About half of the duty officers expressed willingness to change and cooperate, but were still structurally challenged (frustrated at answering media phone calls). Most of the media representatives spoken to perceived structural barriers in the way they received information from the duty office, and they all expressed willingness to cooperate in creating changes. Several reporters expressed structural challenges within their own systems, such as the requirement to seek three confirmations of facts before a story could be released, a barrier that falls outside of the scope of this conflict analysis.

Some of the invited reporters declined to participate in my proposed meeting. Some may have declined as a result of a negative attitude regarding collaboration, or to avoid the perception that they were being co-opted by the police. No data came to my attention to indicate that this occurred. However, in the interest of a completely fair and objective analysis, this possibility could be examined in future research. The reporters that attended the meeting were very receptive and appreciative at being asked to participate in a process to improve communication and cooperation.

No deception was involved, and the goal to improve the working relationship between the two groups was clearly stated. Ground rules were provided verbally and in writing to ensure that the meeting was respectful and productive. The ground-rules about respectful behaviour were referred to several times throughout the meeting, and a debriefing occurred at the end of the meeting. Although I am a member of the APS, this problem-solving meeting was modeled after traditional mediation processes and I was careful to ensure that all parties were given an equal hearing. The workshop was meant to be a transformative process in which participants gained a better understanding of each other's roles. I also strived to make it a positive experience, consistent with appreciative inquiry processes that are described by Sampson et al. in their book, *Positive Approaches to Peacebuilding: A Resources for Innovators* (2003). A particularly useful aspect of the appreciative inquiry model, in this case, was asking the participants to recall things that have worked well in the past. This is why I invited senior supervising

journalist managers; they have been around long enough to know what has worked in the past. The second reason was the need for people who have the authority to change policy, as well as the credibility to take back positive outcomes of the meeting and train and encourage their colleagues.

Refreshments and food were provided by the APS, and the room (in a city office) was set up in a circle to facilitate an open discussion and sharing of ideas. After introductions, I distributed an agenda and ground rules for the meeting, asking for everyone's agreement to maintain a respectful work environment. I explained the agenda and advised that there would be no surprises. I also advised that the syndicate groups would be mixed with members of the police and the media in order to encourage collaboration. I conducted a brief presentation on the history of police-media relations and how they have evolved, in particular with advancing technology and its related challenges. For example, I described how it is not uncommon for the media to hear police calls on their radio scanners and arrive at crime scenes before the responding police. This presents unique challenges for duty officers when reporters ask them for updates. I led a discussion and outlined the differences between zero-sum games in which there is a loser and a winner, and win-win solutions in which everyone gains (Jeong, 1995). I explained that the goal was to avoid linear win-lose thinking and instead seek win-win solutions (Jeong, 1995). I conducted this discussion in an interactive format in order to engage participants for maximum buy-in.

The larger group was divided into three breakout groups, so that one of the three PIO office staff could be in each group. Media and police members were distributed randomly and equally between three groups, and clear instructions were provided along with copies of the detailed exercise plan. Three separate breakout rooms were used, and easels and markers were provided. I moved from room to room and encouraged the groups to identify problems and appoint spokespersons to present each group's findings. After 30 minutes, the three groups were joined back into a larger group and the findings were presented. A larger discussion was held to rank the identified problems according to priority. The three groups were consistent in the major issues that were identified, and reaching consensus on the main issues was straightforward. The same process was followed for the solution finding phase, and the follow-up discussion was oriented around agreement on the best attainable solutions going forward.

Police participants spent considerable time describing, for the media, the role of the duty office, and the frustration that is caused when reporters call for information that cannot be provided. The media representatives did not realize that duty officers are working in real-time command of major incidents, ensuring sufficient resources, making notifications internally and to other agencies, and directing investigations. Once a case is assigned to detectives it is inappropriate for the duty officer to attempt answering questions for several reasons: they do not have the current information, and inappropriate release of information could jeopardize an investigation or even put officers and the public in danger. From the media participants, the duty officers learned that reporters are often calling only to confirm minimal information, because some agencies require reporters to have three confirmations of information before they can publish a story. Overall, this open discussion created a much better mutual understanding of the roles, mandates, challenges and goals. Before the meeting was closed, a round-table chance to speak for all parties ensured that every participant spoke about the experience of the meeting, and their impressions.

#### **Observations**

The police-media relationship can be understood largely as an approach-avoidance scenario, as most media representatives wanted change and about half of the duty officers were indifferent or wanted to avoid addressing the conflict. There was a motivation within the APS, however, to improve the working relationship between duty officers and the media, even though some officers were resistant or indifferent. Hence, the conflict resolution goal that emerged was to shift the duty officers from avoidance to agreement and willingness to enter an approach-approach relationship (Lewin's unfreezing stage) (1947). Increased willingness to change and collaborate, along with reduced structural challenges, it was speculated, should result in substantial improvements to the police-media working relationship. Improved situational factors (the times in which media are allowed to call) should alleviate intergroup tensions

#### (Cheldelin, Druckman, & Fast, 2003).

The results of both syndicate sessions and the larger group consensus were as expected. The main structural problem was the time in which the media were restricted to calling the duty office with inquiries. Surprisingly, none of the stakeholders present suggested expanding the time periods. I interpret this as a display of their willingness to be reasonable. After a lengthy discussion, the group determined that the times could be adjusted to better accommodate all of the different media time needs, as deadlines for completed stories vary between print, radio and televised agencies. For instance, updates to web-based stories are ongoing; television has specific deadlines before stories are aired; and the print media have different deadlines for their editors and printing processes.

The group identified new access times, which better meet the needs of the different news outlets, as well as the needs of the duty officers. Instead of 10:00 PM to midnight, the group decided on 8:30 to 9:30 PM, and then 10:30 to 11:30 PM would meet everyone's needs. These timeframes are more useful for a wider range of reporters, and also more effective for the duty officers, as the evening shift officers are still on duty between 8:30 PM and 9:30 PM and can better speak to what occurred during their shift, rather than passing information to the nightshift officer. A senior news editor commented after this exercise: "I can't believe that we actually came to consensus on these issues," referring mainly to existing competitive relationships between the media outlets.

The other main issue was a complaint by the duty officers that reporters regularly ask for sensitive information that cannot be provided. A related issue was the previously mentioned fishing or vague questions such as "anything to report?" The senior editors were receptive to these points, agreeing that fishing is not appropriate, but explained that the journalistic community is suffering the same demographic challenges as other industries, with mass baby boom retirements, and many younger reporters need more training and direction. The media representatives all expressed appreciation for the added insight into the role of the duty officers and advised that they would direct and educate their staff members on these issues. They also collectively asked that updates be provided on critical issues such as patient conditions. For example, when a release is issued stating that a person involved in a car accident was taken to the hospital in "critical condition," a change in this person's condition to "stable" affects the public's interest in the story; thus, reporters would appreciate such updates.

Both groups agreed that extending the work hours of PIO officers would potentially address all of the identified issues. Having a PIO on call during the day and evening shifts would alleviate many of these problems. However, this is not a perfect solution either, because there will still be major events and the need for inquires overnight, even if APS were to expand the PIO office hours. Considering APS is challenged for human resources, this solution is not likely to be implemented. Nevertheless, I agreed to take all of the suggestions back to the larger group of duty officers and APS Chief's executive office.

The media representatives were generally receptive to the workshop and expressed appreciation for APS taking the initiative to improve collaboration. Several of the participating duty officers reported afterward that they were initially apprehensive, but changed their minds after the workshop, feeling that it had derived positive outcomes, and more consensus than they expected. After the workshop took place, I addressed the entire duty office group, including the members who missed the meeting, advising them of the findings and recommendations that had emerged. They were generally receptive to the time changes and the possibility of expanding the PIO office. They were less receptive to sending updates on patient conditions and the status of events, as this would require more effort. When this topic was discussed the conversation turned to the content in our messages. Some officers were resistant to change, and argued to reduce the amount of information provided to the media, restricting it to only public safety related information- such as hazards, requests for assistance and road closures. It is interesting to note that these concerns came mainly from officers who were unable to attend the workshop. Those officers also complained that they were not included in the meeting. I assured them that the next meeting, if done, would be scheduled on a day when those officers could attend, and perhaps the ones who had attended the first meeting might need to be excluded due to their duties. At a meeting with APS executives in the Chief's office, I summarized the meeting and its findings. The executive stressed the need for transparency and availability to the media, and I was directed to rewrite policy for the duty officers,

adjusting the availability times as discussed, and also clarifying the content of messaging to ensure consistency from the different duty officers in making media releases and answering media inquiries.

#### **Discussion and Conclusion**

This analysis and exercise are cursory, and only indicate the opportunity for a larger formal study. However, within its limited scope, the exercise confirmed that collaborative problem solving could improve cooperation between interdependent conflicted parties. The overall benefits of collaboration are clear; the process of working together improved communication and the relationship between the two groups. It reduced territoriality and gave people a sense of ownership in shared solutions. The structural issues were easily identified. The access hours were a relatively simple fix and were implemented.

Logistical challenges can hamper effectiveness of change. In this case, it was impossible to get all of the active duty officers into a meeting at the same time. It would be difficult to run separate meetings in order to include all of the duty officers, as the media stakeholders also find it challenging to attend long meetings. In the future, it would be most effective to have the officers on duty replaced, so that the entire duty office unit can attend the meeting. This may ensure better collaboration and buy-in as-well-as consistency between officers. Only six media representatives attended, and that number could have been twenty or more. Clearly, more focus must be placed on inclusion of all of the stakeholders; constant turnover and reassignment within APS, and in the media agencies creates a situation wherein continued consensus is impossible without periodic maintenance. Fragmentation and competition within the media community also frustrates finding lasting solutions that meet evervone's needs.

In future similar scenarios, more focus should be placed on how shared solutions are put into practice. Any alteration in policy requires careful attention to how those changes can be implemented and how they will affect the people involved. In this case, a successful reconciliation occurred; however, not all of the stakeholders were involved in the process. Feedback afterwards revealed that some people that were not involved had less buy-in for the proposed solutions. This is a clear example of the "reentry factor" described by Sampson (2003). In this case several duty officers went off for a meeting with media representatives and then returned with ideas for change. Non-participants did not experience the transformative aspect of the workshop and, therefore (it is speculated), had less buy-in for the agreed upon solutions. It is unknown if this occurred among the participating media representatives in this case. This is another area that warrants future research.

These findings also corroborate Lewin's change management model (1947). The need for change could have been developed better among all participants, perhaps during initial interviews. Then, acceptance and internalization of proposed solutions (refreezing) could have been done more effectively through follow-up seminars, perhaps in the form of joint training (Cameron, & Green 2004; Lewin, 1947). In this case, I could have been more time gaining support from other Duty Officers to seek changes. Perhaps the same could have been encouraged among counterparts in the media industry. This also is an area for potential future research.

A future repeat of this exercise could include conflict resolution being integrated within a framework such as Lewin's model (Lewin, 1947), to ensure that the emerging collaborative solutions are implemented effectively and that the relationships are maintained. In this case, unfreezing can involve an increased focus, as early as the initial contact or in the preliminary interviews, on gaining buy-in from the stakeholders to work together for win-win solutions and to implement change. My initial invitation set the tone by including language indicating that collaboration is the goal. However, in the future, the outcome of similar exercises may be improved by personal phone calls or face-to-face conversations with the people invited, to provide a deeper explanation of our goals and create a greater impetus for change.

Having received positive feedback from the stakeholders after this first workshop, a certain degree of unfreezing can be expected to occur naturally, as word-of-mouth travels among local media professionals and APS duty officers. In particular, the media will likely be more willing to come out in larger numbers for the next meeting after they see that the police actually listened and implemented the changes that were agreed upon. Another positive outcome of this research is the exposure that duty

officers and senior media professionals experienced regarding conflict resolution practices. The duty officers who participated in this exercise all spoke highly of its effectiveness, and are now more likely to seek collaboration within their future commands, and also with partner agencies in the community. This exercise indicates potential value in increased conflict resolution training for police officers. Similarly, media representatives expressed the same positive experience.

Future research should focus on a deeper analysis of the personal characteristics of participants, and structural aspects- in this case the system of communications between the duty officers and reporters. This research applies to scenarios wherein interdependent organizations with strong cultural identities must work effectively together. Military, prison guards, scholars, medical professionals, social workers, teachers, and administrators may all fit these criteria and may be suitable subject groups for future similar research.

Druckman's situational model (Cheldelin, Druckman, & Fast, 2003) describes the significance of assessing the personal characteristics of involved parties as well as situational aspects that can cause tension. This model facilitates insights into the police-media relationship, but more could be done in analyzing the nuances of these complex organizational cultures and how they interact with others. This aspect needs careful attention in future research on interdependent organizations. Perhaps the most significant finding of this research was the complexity of even the most straightforward of conflicts. Dr. Byrne (2010) has described the complexity of conflicts using a metaphor of a social cube, which creates an image of the many interconnected dimensions that play a part in conflicts.

Overall, this exercise shed light on key issues, helped identify potential solutions, and engaged the partners to collaborate on win-win solutions that ultimately improved their collective public service; but there is room for much more improvement and a need for continuous attention to it. By improving communication and understanding each other's perspectives, participants found common ground and achieved their objectives. While the implementation of solutions was problematic, the research identified the significance of change management as an integral part of problem solving in the workplace. It has set a course for improved future happiness, if not true love, in the arranged marriage between interdependent groups such as police and the media.

**About the Author:** Robert Chrismas is a career police officer with twenty-eight years of Canadian law enforcement experience. He completed Bachelors programs in psychology, developmental studies and justice and law enforcement in 1988 and his Master of Public Administration degree (MPA) in 2008, at the University of Winnipeg and University of Manitoba. Robert is currently a Doctoral student of Peace and Conflict Studies at the Mauro Centre for Peace and Justice, University of Manitoba. Email: <u>bchrismas@winnipeg.ca</u>.

#### References

Becker, H. (1967). Whose side are we on? Social Problems, 14, 239-247.

- Bellew, S., Tori, C., & Liederbach, J. (2004). *Police-media relations at critical incidents: interviews from Oklahoma City*. Texas: University of North Texas.
- Bonner, M.D. (2009). Media as social accountability: The case of police violence in Argentina. *International Journal of the Press*, 14, 296-312.
- Boyle, R. (1999). Spotlight Strathclyde: police and media strategies. *Corporate Communications: An International Journal*, 4, 2, 93-97.
- Bridges, W. (2003). *Managing Transitions: Making the Most of Change, Second edition*. Cambridge, MA, USA: Perseus Publishing.
- Byrne, S. (2010). Personal communication, October 6<sup>th</sup>.
- Byrne, Sean, Sandole, D., Sandole-Staroste, I., & Senehi, J. (2009). *Handbook in Conflict Analysis and Resolution*. Oxford, UK: Routledge.

- Cameron, E., & Green, M. (2004). *Making Sense of Change Management: A Complete Guide to the Models, Tools and Techniques of Organizational Change*. Virginia, USA: Sterling, Kogan Page Limited.
- Cheldelin, S., Druckman, D., & Fast, L. (2003). *Conflict: From Analysis to Intervention*. New York: Continuum.
- Cooke, L., & Sturges, P. (2009). Police and media relations in an era of freedom of information. *Policing & Society*, 19, 4.
- Crank, J. (1997,1998). Understanding Police Culture. Cincinnati, OH: Anderson.
- Deuze, M. (2005). What is journalism? Professional identity and ideology of journalists reconsidered. *Journalism*, 6, 442–464.
- Gladwell, M. (2002). The Tipping Point. New York: Back Day.
- Graber, D.A. (1980). Crime, news and the public. New York: Praeger.
- Guffey, J. (1992). The Police And The Media: Proposals For Managing Conflict Productively. *American Journal of Police*, X1, 1.
- Hanitzsch, T. (2005). Journalists in Indonesia: Educated but timid watchdogs. *Journalism Studies*, 6, 493–508.
- Herscovitz, H. G. (2004). Brazilian journalists' perceptions of media roles, ethics, and foreign influences on Brazilian journalism. *Journalism Studies*, 5, 1, 71–86.
- Jeong, H. W. (1995). Peace and Conflict Studies: An Introduction. Burlington, VT: Ashgate.
- Lewin, K. 1947. Frontiers in Group Dynamics. Human Relations, 15-41.
- McCombs, M.E., Shaw, D.L. (1972). The agenda-setting function of mass media. *Public Opinion Quarterly*, 40, 176-187.
- Nickels, E., & Arvind V. (2008). Dimensions of police culture: a study in Canada, India, and Japan. *Policing: An International Journal of Police Strategies and Management*, 31, 2, 186-209.
- Niederhoffer, A. (1967). *Behind the Shield: The Police in Urban Society*. New York, NY: Doubleday.
- Paoline, E. A., Myers, S., & Worden, R. E. (2000). Police culture, individualism, and community policing: evidence from two police departments. *Justice Quarterly*, 17, 3, 575-605.
- Prenzler, T. (1997). Is there a police culture? *Australian Journal of Public Administration*, 56, 4, 47-56.
- Ramaprasad, J. (2001). A profile of journalists in post-independence Tanzania. *Gazette*, 63, 539–556.
- Sampson, C., Abu-Niner, M., Liebler, C., & Whitney, D. (2003). *Positive Approaches to Peacebuilding:* A Resource for Innovators. Ohio, USA: Taos Institute Publications.
- Sandole D. (2009) p. 49 in Cheldelin, S., Druckman D. & Fast, L. (2003). *Conflict: From Analysis to Intervention*. New York: Continuum.
- Schellenberg, J. A. (1996). *Conflict Resolution, Theory, Research, and Practice*. New York, USA: University of New York Press.
- Selke, W., & Bartoszek, M. (1984). Police and Media Relations: The Seeds of Conflict. *Criminal Justice Review*, 9, 25.
- Sheufele, D.A. (1999). Framing as a theory of media effects. Journal of Communication, 49, 103-122.
- Simmel, G. (1955). in Schellenberg, J. (1996). *Conflict Resolution, Theory, Research, and Practice*. State University of New York Press, Albany, New York.
- Skolnick, J. H. (1994). Justice without Trial: Law Enforcement in Democratic Society, 3rd ed. New York NY: MacMillan.
- Simmons, H. (1999). Media, police, and public information: from confrontation to conciliation. *Communications and the Law*, 21.2, June, 69, 1.
- Splichal, S., & Sparks C. (1994). Journalists for the 21st century. Tendencies of professionalization among first-year students in 22 countries. Norwood, NJ: Ablex.
- Surrette, R. (1989). Media trials. Journal of Criminal Justice, 17, 293-308.

- Van Maanen, J. (1978). The asshole. in Manning, P.K. and van Maanen, John. (Eds), *Policing: A View From the Street* Santa Monica, CA: Goodyear Publishing, p. 221-38.
- Van Maanen, J. (1974). Working the street: a developmental view of police behavior. in Jacob, H. (Ed.), *The Potential for Reform of Criminal Justice*. Beverly Hills CA: Sage p. 83-130.
- Weaver, D. H. (1998). *The global journalist: News people around the world*. Cresskill, NJ: Hampton.
- Weaver, D. H., Randall, A. B., Brownlee, B. J., Voakes, P., & Wilhoit G. C. (2007). *The American journalist in the 21st century: U.S. news people at the dawn of a new millennium*. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.
- Westley, W. (1970). *Violence and the Police: A Sociological Study of Law, Custom, and Morality.* Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.
- Zwell, M. (2000). Creating a Culture of Competence. USA: John Wiley & Sons, Inc.

#### **Book Reviews**

## On the Frontlines: Gender, War, and the Post-Conflict Process Written by: Fionnuala Ni Aolain, Dina Francesca Haynes, and Naomi Cahn New York: Oxford University Press, 2011, 376 pages.

While transitional justice and post-conflict reconstruction is a newly emerging and rapidly expanding area of study, little scholarship has drawn attention to its gendered dimensions. *On the Frontlines: Gender, War, and the Post-Conflict Process* is an ambitious and comprehensive book that aims to explore the role that gender plays in the construction and implementation of post-conflict transitional processes. Drawing on a range of feminist and interdisciplinary approaches, Law Professors Ni Aolain, Haynes, and Cahn provide a detailed account of the powerfully transformative potential of the post-conflict terrain, and persuasively argue that without a gender-sensitive lens, gender hierarchies entrenched historically and exacerbated during conflict will extend into the post-conflict phase. Without essentializing women's roles or experiences, the book interrogates in great detail how the dominant social constructions of femininity and masculinity impact societies' post-conflict policies at each stage, in a variety of national contexts.

On the Frontlines is divided broadly into three sections: the dynamics of pre-conflict and conflict settings, 'toward peace' in the immediate aftermath of war, and longer-term reconstruction and development. The first section stresses the need for more detailed analysis of how women's prewar political, social and economic status relates to their experiences in conflict and its aftermath, and criticizes the way in which dominant discourses of all men as militaristic (hypermasculine) and all women as victims (or peacemakers) simplifies what actually happens during times of war.

The second (and by far the longest) section of the book is entitled 'toward peace,' and stresses that post-conflict societies which are not safe for women are not secure in the broad sense of the term, for example as domestic and gender-based violence often increases in this context. The authors argue for a new paradigm of security in which there is an emphasis on local participation and women are meaningfully represented in all decision-making processes. The next chapter looks at the complex issues around international intervention (broadly defined), in order to identify points at which intervening can operate to recalibrate gender roles and improve the lives of women and men. Further, this section articulates how traditionally masculine-dominated Peacekeeping missions and Disarmament, Demobilization, and Reintegration (DDR) programs could be effectively enhanced if women's concerns were integrated into their objectives. Moving to a discussion of criminal accountability for gender violence, the authors draw on a variety of cases to examine the extent to which post-conflict accountability norms actually map onto women's subjective experiences. Without downplaying the significance of increased international recognition of sexual violence during war, they argue we need to be attuned to other forms of harm which impact women disproportionately. The book also explores alternative mechanisms to retributive justice, including truth commissions and reparations, and how each can centralize gender. Finally in this section, the authors explicate how law reform and Constitutional design offers possibilities to advance women's rights. The authors persuasively argue that beyond gender mainstreaming, which has largely become a convenient tool for policymakers, a gender-central approach must be adopted in which the equal rights and social and economic empowerment of women are paramount.

The final section of the book examines long-term reconstruction and development, arguing that success depends significantly on gender integration. Much attention has been given to political quotas for women's participation, but greater commitment to social and economic rights is needed for real transformation. The authors explore in detail processes of democratization, institution-building, as well as the consequences of economic liberalization which often disproportionally burden women.

One of the greatest strengths of this book is in providing insightful critiques, but also including recommendations and solutions for gender centrality at each stage of the transitional process. The authors have drawn a detailed picture of the complexities of integrating gender into post-conflict processes, while being deliberately attentive to avoid generalizing women's experiences. Perhaps one of the drawbacks of

this book is its attempt to extract sweeping conclusions from such a widely varied set of complex case studies, but it is an effective overview of the importance of moving gender to the forefront in post-conflict processes, from which scholars researching particular cases in detail can draw. While aimed at an academic audience, the lessons elucidated here are crucial for activists, development/aid workers, peacekeepers, public servants, researchers, and anyone interested in advancing the transformative possibilities of post-conflict societies. Offering concrete analysis and practical solutions, this book persuasively argues for a broader and deeper attempt to alter the social, political, and legal hierarchies which have long entrenched gender inequality, 'engendering' real transformation in post-conflict societies.

> Review by Nicole Ephgrave PhD Candidate, University of Western Ontario

#### Mobility, Sexuality and AIDS Edited by: Felicity Thomas, Mary Haour-Knipe and Peter Aggleton New York: Routledge Taylor and Francis Group, 2010, 240 pages.

Mobility, Sexuality and AIDS examines migrants' motivation for migrating, their experiences in destination countries, and vulnerability to HIV/AIDS infection. It also explores the effects of migration on home countries. The book consists of a compilation of case studies drawn from different countries such as the U.S.A, Mexico, China, South Africa, The Gambia, Nigeria, and Kenya. The case studies discussed in the book were written by seasoned authors using both quantitative and qualitative research methods.

The book is organised into sixteen chapters - two introductory chapters and fourteen other chapters spread across three broad sections covering such topics as: mobility and the experience of the self; sexuality, sexual identity and migration; mobility and pleasure; and mobility and work.

The editors outlined a number of factors that motivate people to move within and across national borders. The most illuminating factors are gender inequality and the freedom to pursue sexual orientations. For instance, the editors explained how gender inequality compelled young Gambian men to migrate to tourist centres in The Gambia to seek sexual relationships with older female tourists in the hope of making some money to meet expected family needs or establishing lasting partnership aimed at providing an opportunity to migrate to the west. Furthermore, forced marriages and the inability to own property forced some women in parts of Kenya to migrate to work on tea plantations. Others, however, migrate solely for the freedom to practice their sexual orientation without facing hostility, or to fulfill sexual fantasies devoid of commitments.

The book also discusses the realities of migrants in destination countries and describes them as varied and complex. In some context, migrants experience physical and sexual abuse, forced prostitution, poverty and labour exploitation, which potentially increase their vulnerability to HIV infections. In other settings, migrants integrate well and are protected against HIV risk because they have access to social amenities, sexual health information, and services which were not easily accessible in migrants' home countries.

The editors' exposition on the socio-economic impacts of returning migrants on their home countries is quite intriguing. While the opportunity to invest money earned abroad coupled with the tendency to be profligate in spending by returnees may promote economic growth in home economies, the promiscuous life styles of some returnees, however, expose both the returnees and the home populations to HIV infection. In addition, the new cultures (often considered indecent) transferred by returnees to home countries have been criticised particularly by the older generation and some religious bodies in the home countries as challenging the moral fabric of the home countries.

The strength of this book lies in its ability to assemble substantial range of empirical evidence from different countries to challenge common assumptions about mobility, HIV, and AIDS. In some parts of South Africa, it is women and not men who are perceived to infect their partners with HIV. The

editors did a good job of identifying research gaps and also providing valuable policy recommendations to mitigate problems associated with mobility, sexuality and AIDS.

There are inevitable weaknesses. First, the final portion of the introduction which speaks about the fears that mobile populations or outsiders might bring infectious disease needs further interrogation - especially in the light of the lack of evidence within the book itself. Second, the last section on "migration and work" focuses on studies from developing countries. Studies from other regions of the world could have been included to broaden the scope and perspective of readers. Nonetheless, the book makes important contributions to understanding migrants' experiences and vulnerabilities to HIV/AIDS. It is an invaluable book for policy makers, students and experts working in the fields of migration, development studies, sociology, and public health.

Review by Susan Langmagne University of Saskatchewan

#### Undesirables: White Canada and the Komagata Maru Story Written by: Ali Kazimi Vancouver: Douglas MyIntyre Publishers Inc., 2012, 176 pages.

The *Komagata Maru* is one of Canada's dirty secrets. The vast majority of Canadians have never even heard of this ship that carried 376 would be migrants (340 Sikhs, 12 Hindus and 24 Muslims) from India in 1914. Even fewer would know the active role Canadian officials, including immigration officers, politicians, and the legal actors would play in sealing the fate of those passengers. Ali Kazimi's book, *Undesirables: White Canada and the Komagata Maru Story*, exposes this dark and often forgotten episode in Canadian history. As Kazami notes, this was the first instance where a ship of would-be migrants was turned away from Canada's shores. This incident, along with the responses (both official and unofficial) speaks volumes to how a white settler nation, such as Canada, constructs its identity in the nation building project. The *Komagata Maru* tragedy also illustrates the myth of cultural pluralism within the British colonial Empire and may provide some insights into the limits of multiculturalism in present day Canada. However, at the same time, the story of the *Komagata Maru* is one of resistance, on the part of the passengers and the South Asian community in Canada, through their use of the Canadian legal system to challenge (albeit unsuccessfully) the restrictive and racist immigration policies of the Canadian government.

Building upon his research and the content of his award-winning documentary film, *Continuous Journey*, Kazimi weaves together the intricate details of the *Komagata Maru* and once again brings this story to life in a different medium. This illustrated history includes archival photographs, historical letters and documents, maps, and other striking visuals, that chronicle not only the arrival of South Asian migrants but also positions their arrival within the context of earlier migrants such as anti-Asian policies directed at limiting Chinese and Japanese immigration, the colonization of Canada's indigenous peoples, and African Canadian histories. In doing so, Kazimi demonstrates that the story of the *Komagata Maru* begins not with the boat's arrival in 1914, but rather centuries before and lies in the shared colonial histories of India and Canada.

The premise of Kazimi's argument rests around the tensions between the Dominion of Canada's desire to maintain its white settler nation status by keeping racialized migrants offshore, and the British Imperial government's difficulties in preventing subjects of the British Empire, such as Indian nationals, from migrating to the white settler colonies. These tensions resulted in the Canadian government employing a series of restrictive orders-in-councils such as the "continuous journey" regulation that prevented the immigration of those who did not arrive to Canada through a continuous voyage from their country of origin. The arrival of the *Komagata Maru* sparked a wave of panic amongst white British Colombians, who feared that allowing these migrants to enter and remain in Canada would open a floodgate of migrants from Asia. The process of racialization plays a central part in Kazimi's narrative

analysis, as this was also a period of time when the Canadian government was actively recruiting and welcoming white immigrants from Europe.

Kazimi highlights the social, political, economic, and legal discourses that allowed the *Komagata Maru* and its passengers to be escorted out of Canada by a military warship, eventually to return to India where 22 passengers would be massacred upon disembarking. In particular, the legal discourse played a significant role in how the *Komagata Maru* story would unfold; beginning with the enactment of restrictive legislation and regulations which excluded certain classes of racialized immigrants and culminating in the British Columbia Court of Appeal decision that upheld the exclusionary policies.

Almost a century later, the *Komagata Maru* tragedy has since faded from public memory. However, the discourses surrounding the arrival of Tamil asylum seekers aboard two boats, the MV Ocean Lady in 2009 and the MV Sun Sea in 2010, demonstrates how relevant the issues and analysis found in Kazimi's book is to present day Canada. The reception and reaction of the Tamil boat arrivals echoes many of the sentiments expressed by the arrival of the *Komagata Maru*. *Undesirables* reminds us that if we are to learn anything from our past we must actively recollect, recall and retell the stories of the past so that their mistakes are not forgotten in the present or repeated in the future.

Review by Harini Sivalingam York University

## Principles and Practice of Structural Equation Modeling (3<sup>rd</sup> Ed.) Written by: Rex B. Kline New York: Guilford Press, 2011, 427 pages.

Structural equation modeling (SEM) is a set of related statistical techniques involving factor and path analyses. SEM may be applied to data collected through experimental and non-experimental research designs, and is increasingly used across a wide range of research disciplines. As reflected in the title, *Principles and Practice of Structural Equation Modeling* (Third Edition), the goal of this book written by Rex B. Kline is to provide a comprehensive introduction to principles and assumptions underlying SEM, as well as its application. This book is suitable for advanced researchers who are new to SEM, and is fully accessible to graduate students. In depth knowledge of matrix algebra and experience with SEM computer software are not prerequisites for this book given that it is more conceptual than mathematical in nature and is not centered on one software package. Accordingly, this book contains 13 chapters and is divided into three separate but related sections.

Part I, "Concepts and Tools," introduces the rationale, data input, and preparation for SEM. An important point highlighted is that one can use raw data or summary statistics based on raw data (e.g., covariance matrix) in SEM. As well, Dr. Kline discusses how properties of the data, such as positive definiteness of a covariance matrix and multivariate normality of raw data can influence the outcome of SEM analyses. This section also includes a description of major commercial and open source software packages used to conduct SEM.

Part II, "Core Techniques," provides a detailed discussion of different types of SEM in relation to hypothesis testing, namely path analysis involving observed variables, as well as confirmatory factor analysis and structural regression models involving latent variables. Confirmatory factor analysis is important for assessing the factor structure of scales and construct validity. Evaluation of model fit and different estimation methods used to analyze structural equation models are also covered in this section. Dr. Kline's illustrative approach to describing the assumptions and testing procedure for each type of structural equation model is a hallmark of the book. Specifically, graphics, prose, and examples from published research assist the reader in acquiring a thorough understanding of different structural equation models and their application. Exercises are provided at the end of each chapter in Part II which affords the reader the opportunity to gain an applied understanding of different SEM methods.

Part III, "Advanced Techniques and Avoiding Mistakes," provides an overview of advanced methods in SEM, including interaction effects of observed and latent variables, multi-group analyses,

60

latent growth curve models, and multilevel SEM. Although not described in detail, enough information is provided in this overview to understand and apply these advanced methods. As well, Dr. Kline offers 52 suggestions on how to avoid common mistakes at all stages of a SEM analysis which are a unique feature of this book and an invaluable resource for researchers who are beginning their SEM training.

Overall, *Principles and Practice of Structural Equation Modeling* (3<sup>rd</sup> Ed.) is an important contribution to the theory and application of factor and path analyses. This third edition is superior to previous editions in many ways; most notably, the content reflects current advances and "topic boxes" are provided to outline specific issues. One limitation of this book is that it provides restricted detail on more advanced uses of SEM. However, the website that accompanies this book lists additional resources to aid in developing a more sophisticated understanding of SEM. In sum, *Principles and Practice of Structural Equation Modeling* (3<sup>rd</sup> Ed.) is a comprehensive introduction to many facets of SEM and is a must read for those venturing into the area of factor and path analyses.

Review by Nassim Tabri Department of Psychology Concordia University

Review by Corinna M. Elliot Department of Psychiatry Massachusetts General Hospital Harvard Medical School



# Call for Papers (Winter 2013)

## Due date for submissions: January 8<sup>th</sup>, 2013

CGJSC is actively seeking submissions of original empirical research for our winter issue. The scope of CGJSC is purposefully broad in order to offer a diverse range of graduate students the opportunity to submit their research for publication. Examples of acceptable submissions that fall within the journal's scope are, but not limited to: **theory pieces**, **conceptual pieces**, **critical analyses**, **substantive explorations and book reviews**. Qualitative, quantitative and mixed methodologies are accepted. We aim to publish insightful and well-written empirical pieces that enrich the collective knowledge within the disciplines of sociology and criminology.

CGJSC welcomes submissions from graduate students involved in research outside of, but related to, the disciplines of sociology and criminology. All fields within the social sciences (ex: Political Science, History, Psychology, Religious Studies, Women's Studies, Labor Studies, Health Sciences, Economics, Anthropology) are encouraged to submit provided that they demonstrate a direct link to a sociological and/or criminological area of study.

We invite all interested parties to log on to our journal website (http://cgjsc-rcessc.uwaterloo.ca) to review our mission statement and submission guidelines. Submissions are securely and efficiently processed via our journal management software integrated into our website.



# **Appel à communication (Hiver 2013)**

## Date Limite : 8 janvier, 2013

La Revue canadienne des études supérieures en sociologie et criminologie (RCESSC) est toujours à la recherche de propositions de recherche empirique originale pour son deuxième édition. Le cadre de la RCESSC a un caractère délibérément général de manière à offrir à une grande variété d'étudiant(e)s des cycles supérieurs l'occasion de proposer leur recherche pour une publication. Des exemples de propositions acceptables cet automne à l'intérieur du mandat de la revue sont, mais ne sont pas limités, aux domaines suivants : **des exposés théoriques, des articles conceptuels, des analyses critiques, des études de fond et des résumés de livre**. Nous acceptons les méthodologies qualitative, quantitative et des méthodologies mixtes. Notre objectif est de publier des articles judicieux et empiriques bien rédigés, qui enrichissent la connaissance collective dans les disciplines de la sociologie et de la criminologie.

La RCESSC sollicite des articles des étudiant(e)s des cycles supérieurs qui participent à des recherches dans diverses disciplines qui peuvent être reliées à la sociologie et à la criminologie. Tous les étudiant(e)s des cycles supérieurs appartenant à domaines pertinents aux sciences sociales, comme les sciences politiques, l'histoire, la psychologie, les études religieuses, les études des femmes, les études du travail, les sciences de la santé, l'économie, l'anthropologie, sont encouragés à proposer des articles qui établissent un lien direct à la sociologie et à la criminologie.

Nous invitons l'ensemble des participant(e)s à ouvrir une session sur le site Web de notre revue (<u>http://cgjsc-rcessc.uwaterloo.ca</u>) pour examiner notre énoncé de mission et les lignes directrices pour soumettre vos articles. Les articles soumis sont traités de manière sécuritaire et efficace par le biais de notre logiciel de gestion de la revue intégré à notre site Web.